# Assessment Report on the Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) performance of selected sectors at Federal and Regional level 



## Acronyms and Abbreviations

BoFED: Bureau of Finance and Economic Development
E.C.: Ethiopian calendar

GRB: Gender Responsive Budgeting
MoFEC: Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation
MoFED: Ministry of finance and Economic Development
MoWCA: Ministry of Women and Children Affairs
SNNP: Southern Nations, Nationalities and People

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgement .....  i
PART ONE ..... 1
1.1 Introduction ..... 1
1.2 Objective of the Assessment ..... 2
1.3 Scope of the Assessment ..... 2
1.4 Methodological approach ..... 2
1.5 Limitations of the assessment ..... 4
PART TWO ..... 4
2. Literature Review ..... 4
2.1 The Gender Issue and theoretical discourse. ..... 4
2.2 Sociological perspectives ..... 4
2.3 Gender and development ..... 5
2.4 Gender Mainstreaming ..... 7
2.5 Gender responsive budgeting (GRB) ..... 8
2.6 The Ethiopian Experience on gender equality endeavors ..... 9
2.7 Budget process in Ethiopia ..... 11
PART THREE. ..... 15
3. Findings of the assessment ..... 15
Findings in the Federal Sectors ..... 15
Findings in the selected Regional Sectors ..... 24
Amhara National Regional State ..... 24
Dire Dawa city Administration ..... 43
Tigray Regional State ..... 53
Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples Regional State ..... 62
The Addis Ababa City Administration ..... 78
Oromia Regional State ..... 90
Benshangul Gumuz Regional State ..... 101
Ethiopian Somali Region State ..... 110
PART FOUR ..... 120
MAJOR CHALLENGES IDENTIFIED IN THE ASSESSMENT ..... 120
PROPOSED RECOMMENDATIONS ..... 120
CONCLUSION ..... 121
ANNEX ..... 123
REFERENCES ..... 131

## Acknowledgement

The Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation extends its appreciation to Federal and Regional level selected sectoral Ministries and Bureaus for availing their Planning, Budgeting and Gender Officials and experts for the assessment. The Ministry would also forward its appreciation to UNWOMEN for providing financial and technical support for the assessment.

Finally, we would like to thank all the experts in the Gender Directorate who participated heavily in this assessment. We would also like to take this opportunity to express our gratitude to the stakeholders that took part in this assessment of gender responsive budgeting. Their collaboration in ensuring the participation and benefit of women in the developmental endeavors of the country as well as improving the status of gender equality across the country was invaluable.

## Part one

### 1.1 Introduction

Problems of justice and lack of fairness in any society's cultural, economic, social and political structure; owing to different reasons; have been observed to pose challenges to the extensive efforts exerted to realize comprehensive growth resulting in unequal access of economic resources for all citizens. In this regard, problems of fairness that are as a result of one's gender are one of the major problems witnessed in a variety of frameworks; particularly prevalent in developing countries are sexual violence, discrimination and stigma; caused by different practices of culture, they have a serious negative impact in gaining economic, social and political benefits.

Social opportunities and budget allotment efforts have been undertaken to take action at various levels after reaching a common consensus that foregoing said efforts is a global problem despite the different causes and solutions required to resolve the problems. In this respect, the CEDAW agreement signed on 1979 aiming to eliminate any discrimination practices against women; the Beijing action plan adopted on 1995 as well as the continental Solomon convention are significant steps taken.

Since Ethiopia is one of the countries with a, a number of activities have been undertaken by governmental and nongovernmental organizations to tackle the problem with regards to recognizing its urgency and severity. The government took steps in arranging favorable conditions to assist such activities; this is mainly observed in the various provisions stipulated under article 35 of the constitution outlining the participation and benefiting rights of women. Furthermore, many activities are being undertaken to adopt the "National policy for women, 1994 by the FDRE government which led to the inclusion of gender issues during budgeting and which also led to making women equally beneficiaries of fair resource distribution within society, thus enabling women to be economic and social beneficiaries. Budgeting is the major instrument in executing these policies and it is a tool used to measure the commitment of the government in implementing prioritized policies and strategies. The gender responsive budgeting manual is one of the mainstream tools which aims to transform the biased attitude of the public which has been chronically Intertwined within society. Furthermore, the main tactic is to enforce the inclusion of gender issues in all policies, programs and projects. As stated previously, the main instrument in the inclusion of gender issues is the analysis of a gender budget, requiring the training of
trainers (ToT), awareness creation programs and assessments conducted at various times which will be used as inputs for this assessment.

The importance and inclusion of gender issues during budgeting and planning in order to respond to gender equality as well as ensuring equal benefit of all citizens accessing services of the government, has led to steps taken in order to facilitate coordination between federal, regional concerned offices and the Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation (MoFEC). This assessment is one of the various tasks in realizing coordinated procedures and encouraging practices as well as identify problems.

### 1.2 Objective of the Assessment

### 1.2.1 General Objective

The general objective of this assessment was to assess the result of the gender responsive budgeting training and awareness creation in selected Federal and Regional offices as well as to recommend solutions by assessing encountered problems.

### 1.2.2 Specific Objectives

## Specific objectives of the assessment have been to:

$>$ identify good gender responsive budgeting practices in selected sectors,
> draw the way forward on how to institutionalize GRB,
> gather enhancing inputs for GRB training to promote the institutionalization process.
$>$ introduce and promote gender Responsive Budgeting to non-practicing sectors and regions

### 1.3 Scope of the Assessment

This assessment covered Federal and Regional as well as City administration. The regions included Tigray, Amhara, Oromiya, Southern Nations Nationalities People (SNNP), Ethiopian Somali, Benishangul Gumu whereas City Administrations included Dire Dawa city administration and Addis Ababa city Administration. Regarding sectors with budget provisions, the selected sectors were: agriculture, water and energy, health, education, urban development, social and labor affairs, justice, transport, road and micro and small enterprises as well as micro finance sectors.

### 1.4 Methodological approach

To conduct this assessment three methodologies have been applied:

1. Questionnaires: to collect quantitative and qualitative data, a questionnaire with 19 questions has been developed.

The questions included: if respondents were trained with Gender Responsive Budgeting and if they are practicing it, whether the 2007 budget report incorporated gender issues to identify problems; the magnitude of efforts to mainstream gender issues in the 2015/2016 planning and budgeting activities; identify encouraging opportunities for gender mainstreaming in the budgeting process; to determine the manner as to how capacity building trainings should be delivered in order to bring effective gender responsive practices; and also to grade selected offices in their achievement.

The majority of the questionnaire was open ended questions and the participants responded elaborately.

| Federal / Region | Women \% | Men \% |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Federal | 54.3 | 45.7 |
| Tigray | 53.6 | 46.4 |
| Amhara | 38 | 62 |
| Oromiya | 39 | 69 |
| South N/N/P/R | 33.3 | 66.7 |
| Dire Dawa | 39.1 | 60.9 |
| Addis Ababa | 48 | 32 |
| Benishangul Gumuz | 30 | 70 |
| Ethiopian Somali | 32.10 | 67.90 |

Table 1: Respondents by sex
2. Printed materials: with the view of assessing the accuracy of responses gathered by questionnaires, the annual plans, reports and manuals of the offices have been reviewed.
3. Interview: Heads of Gender departments and Planning and Budgeting departments have been interviewed to identify opportunities and challenges around Gender Responsive Procedures as well as to assess actions taken in the monitoring and evaluation system.

### 1.5 Limitations of the assessment

The main limitations that have been encountered in the process of the assessment were the unavailability of experts and officials during the interview, failure in filling out questionnaires, refusal to be interviewed, lack of documents used as input and unavailability of experts to participate in the assessment process.

## Part Two

## 2. Literature Review -

### 2.1 The Gender Issue and theoretical discourse

Gender refers to social, cultural, and psychological traits linked to males and females through particular social contexts. It differs from sex in that it is achieved and not ascribed (Wharton, 2011). As Berscheid (cited in (Kay Bussey \& Albert Bandura, 1999)) described, gender is considered as socially constructed because many of the traits and roles promoted in males and females tend to be differentially valued in society with males generally being regarded as more desirable, effectual, and of higher status.

Society defines how women and men hold positions of power; how they access public resources and private assets in wider society; how they make decisions on sources of livelihood, mobility and places of residence, marriage and partnerships, family planning, reproduction and sexuality; how they divide labor within the household; and the nature and extent of personal ambitions (UN WOMEN, 2014).

As to how gender conception is explained by different perspectives, from the biological point of view gender is due to the physiological role of males and females in reproduction. On the other hand, the psychological perspective focusses on intra-psychic processes governing gender development, i.e. adoption of gender roles within the family through the process of identification, and the social cognitive perspective puts gender as conceptions and role behavior as the products of a broad network of social influences from families to broader societal institutions (KayBussey \& AlbertBandura, 1999).

### 2.2 Sociological perspectives

Sociologically there are three classical perspectives, functionalist (structural functionalism), conflict and symbolic interactionism, with the previous two being macro and the last micro explanations of social phenomenon. Functionalists see the gender issue as to keep the social equilibrium; harmonized men and women should assume their non-overlapping roles with males in the instrumental role (protecting,
providing and linking the family to the outside) and females in the expressive role (emotional support, nurturing and household chores) (Macionis \& Gerber, 2010)

On the contrary, the conflict perspective perceives gender as being an unjust relation between the sexes where the male dominates the power share and conflict puts economic factors as the source of this unbalance; when women gain economic strength by (Macionis \& Gerber, 2010) (Stepnisky \& Ritzer, 2013).

Finding its' root in the conflict theory (Wharton, 2011), the other major theoretical perspective in gender is feminist theory. Within this perspective few variations have been formed with a similar end but different means. Feminist theory looks for macro as well as micro natures of the gender issue, it and links gender inequality with other inequalities in race and class. For instance, in explaining poverty through the gender lens, in what is now being referred to by the literature as the 'feminization of poverty', which is about women being at a higher risk of being poor than men, and the concordant racial and class disadvantages (Wharton, 2011).

As to the forms of feminist theory, liberal feminists are more interested in reform and not a complete restructure of the societal system. However, incorporation of women's needs, interests as well as rights for a meaningful and equitable role should be considered. Socialist feminists more or less reflect conflict perspective where economic security is claimed to be the reason for the inequality. Radical feminists on the other hand, credit male domination to be the real source of the institutional inequality whether in capitalist or socialist society and as a solution this approach advocates for the formation of separate institutions which are women centered (Dunn, Almaquist, \& Chaperz, 1993).

### 2.3 Gender and development

Gender as an important element in the development discourse was mostly regarded to originate from the Women in Development (WID) approach which was popularized during the 1975 United Nations 'First Women Conference' in Mexico and the 'Women's Decade (1975-1985) that was declared on the conference. The WID perspective was mostly concerned with the exclusion of women from the development process and was interested in integrating, for the most part focusing on women in development endeavors (Mannell, 2012 ).

However, the WID proposal doesn't require the exciting development process that allows male domination to radically change, rather it suggests the inclusion of women in the already setup system will solve the problem. This evident gap in the WID approach brought the 1990s theoretical critics which resulted in the development of the Gender and Development (GAD) approach, which was presented at
the 1995 United Nations' Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing as a means of stepping away from the WID approach and towards a framework that incorporated a critical perspective towards acknowledging and addressing underlying structural inequalities (Mannell, 2012). The GAD approach was interested in examining the existing development process, focusing on the socially constructed basis of differences between men and women and emphasizes in making the appropriate changes to challenge the existing gender role and create an equitable, sustainable development with women and men as decision makers (Reeves \& Baden, 2000). Hence as a solution it proposes to empower the disadvantaged women and transform the unequal power relation that exists among men and women (Jahan, 1995).

The centrality of gender equality, women's empowerment and the realization of women's rights in achieving sustainable development has been increasingly recognized in recent decades; the 1992 Rio Declaration on Environment and Development, the 1995 Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action and the 2012 United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, entitled "The future we want" are few testaments to this claim (UNWomen, 2014). Linking gender equality and sustainable development is important for several reasons. Firstly, it is a moral and ethical imperative, secondly, it is critical to redress the disproportionate impact of economic, social and environmental shocks and stresses on women and girls that results from unsustainable pattern of development (Neumayer \& Plümper, 2007), thirdly, and most significantly, it is important to build up women's agency and capabilities to create better synergies between gender equality and sustainable development outcomes.

On the other hand, perspectives on the link between development (especially that of economic development) and gender have a different outlook with regards to what economic development brings to the lives of women. Eastin and Prakash (2013), put the argument in three basic approaches. The Critical theorists and feminists see that capitalistic development strategies have the potential to reinforce patriarchal institutions which are most likely to expose women to exploitative production practices, and force them into low paying jobs all of which undermine gender equality. In opposition to this claim neoliberals suggest that economic development will enhance women's status because it encourages societal integration, supports women's investment in human capital, and creates employment opportunities in relatively higher paying non-farm sectors. Moreover, the theory argues that as growth drivers, trade and foreign direct investment diffuse productivity enhancing and labor-saving technologies all the while it will encourage norms of gender equity (Joshua Eastin \& Aseem Prakash, 2013).

The third perspective in Eastin and Prakash's discourse is that of Boserupian which argues that whilst in the early stages of development both macro patriarchal and micro patriarchal institutions might limit women's occupational opportunities; sustained growth should enhance female labor force participation. Production employment offers women an independent revenue stream, and strengthens their domestic bargaining power, which in turn should undermine patriarchal social structures. In this perspective, the relationship between economic development and gender equality is likely to follow a pattern where equality decreases in the early stages of development and then increases beyond some economic threshold. It stresses that developmental sustainability depends on women's participation (Joshua Eastin \& Aseem Prakash, 2013). Chattopadhyay and Duflo (2004), support this sustainability assertion by contending that, when women have a greater voice and more participation in public administration, public resources are more likely to be allocated towards investment in human development priorities, including child health, nutrition and access to employment (UNWomen, 2014).

Nonetheless, this can only manifest itself when a broad governmental policy encompassing legal, political, and economic measures calls for the enforcement of sexual equality, not as a secondary element but as a priority in planning programs to successfully free women from their traditional confinement of the home. Any economic development which neglects $50 \%$ of its human resources is an unrealistic form of development that can only bring about illusory achievement (Mernissi, 1975). Development models and their subsequent policies will deterministically contribute to unsustainability and the persistence of unequal power relations between women and men (UNWomen, 2014).

### 2.4 Gender Mainstreaming

Gender mainstreaming could be defined as the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in any area and at all levels. It is a strategy for making women's as well as men's concerns and experiences an integral dimension in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and social spheres (UN WOMEN, 2014). It is intended as a way of improving the effectiveness of masculine policies by making visible the gendered nature of assumptions, processes and outcomes (Walby, 2003-4). As a form of theory, it's a process of revision of key concepts in order to grasp a more gendered world rather than the establishment of specialist gender theory (Walby, 2003-4).

As a concept, gender mainstreaming appeared for the first time in international texts after the 1985 United Nations Third World Conference on Women held in Kenya Nairobi. It was seen as a means of promoting the role of women in the field of development and of integrating women's values into
development work (EG-S-MS, 1998). In other words, it's a strategy for promoting gender equality involving integration of the gender perspective in all activities (Haataja, Leinonen, \& Mustakallio, 2011).

So then, what is gender equality? Gender equality could be defined as the concept when the different behaviors, aspirations and needs of both women and men are considered, valued and favored equally. Moreover, both women and men, are free to develop their personal abilities and make choices without the limitations set by stereotypes, rigid gender roles or prejudices (UN WOMEN, 2014).

In recognition of this, several world conventions and declarations had been signed by a significant number of countries. These conventions and declarations had also been the referral point for the gender mainstreaming programs of the signatory countries (MoFED, 2012). One major convention is the 1975 convention on eliminating all forms of discrimination against women (CEDAW). The other is 1993's declaration on elimination of all forms of violence against women (DEVAW). There is also the Beijing platform for action (BPA) signed in 1995, the international conference on population and development (ICPD), the millennium development goals (MDG), and the African charter on rights of women in Africa (the Maputo protocol) (MoWCYA, 2011).

When we come to gender mainstreaming's induction into policy practice, it could be expressed as holding two simultaneous advantages. The first is the promotion of gender equality and justice, which is an end in its own and the second is making mainstream policies effective by the inclusion of gender analysis (Walby, 2003-4). It is also not a strategy to be put into action once; it should be a constant red thread throughout the whole policy process and needs to be implemented in several stages during the policymaking process (EG-S-MS, 1998). One of the multiple stages is policy implementation and budget or resource allocations required.

From gender perspective policies could have three impacts. One, they could be agents to increase the gender disparity. Two, leave no impact in the gender spectrum or three, reduce the gender gap (MoFED, 2012). As Noeleen Heyzer put it, budgets greatly matter because it determines how governments mobilize and allocate public resources into policies and priorities that shape and provide the means to meet the social and economic needs of citizens (UNIFEM, 2002)

### 2.5 Gender responsive budgeting (GRB)

As it was mentioned above, budget holds a crucial role in the gender mainstreaming agenda. Gender responsive budgeting is basically mainstreaming the gender perspective in the budgetary process (UNFPA \& UNIFEM, 2006). It looks at the full government budget from a gender perspective to assess how it will
address the different priorities, needs and interests of women and men, girls and boys of the different categories. When looking at budgets through a gender lens, one can clearly see where the collection and distribution of public money is unequal and inefficient. Therefore, GRB is fundamentally about ensuring that the national budget is allocated equitably and efficiently in implementing national plans and policy objectives (MoFED, 2012).

Australia was the first country to introduce gender sensitive budget analysis (1984-1996). This Australian budget analysis involves three categories: expenditure specifically targeted to women and girls, expenditure for equal employment opportunities and the third, general/mainstream budget expenditure. After the Australian experience, the other significant approach to gender considerate budget is that of South Africa. In 1995, the women's budget initiative was introduced, with main initiators being parliamentary and NGOs. It was set out to improve the quality of life and status of women with respect to the implementation of CEDAW and BPA. The South African approach takes on five steps:

1. Gender situational analysis
2. Policy analysis
3. Resource allocation
4. Monitoring of resource in implementation
5. Assessing impact

### 2.6 The Ethiopian Experience on gender equality endeavors

On the 2014 UNDP gender inequality index Ethiopia ranks at 173 out of 187 countries. This index measures the gender disparity in three aspects. Firstly, reproductive health measured by maternal mortality ratio and adolescent birth rate; secondly, empowerment measured by proportion of parliamentary seats occupied by females and males; thirdly, economic status measured by labor force participation rate of females and males (UNDP, 2014). This paints the picture of the Ethiopian context in a generalist manner. The CSA census report suggests that half of the population of Ethiopia, which is now estimated to be 95 million (www.worldometers.info/world population), are women. Hence the gender disparity effect is much significant for such a large population.

In order to address the gender inequality, the government of Ethiopia has adopted several global and continental conventions, declarations, protocols and international mainstreaming initiatives:

- Convention on eliminating all forms of discrimination against women (CEDAW), which is adopted in 1979 by the UN General Assembly, is often described as an international bill of rights for women.
- Declaration on eliminating violence against women, DEVAW
- Beijing platform for action, BPA
- Millennium development goal, MDG are signed internationally, whereas
- The Solemn declaration on gender equality in Africa, SDGEA and
- The Maputo protocols are continental adaptations.

To implement these international commitments the government of Ethiopia has formulated legal, policy and national strategic frameworks. With regards to the constitution, proclamations such as the federal civil servant (515/2007), labor proclamation (377/2003) and the rural land administration and land use (455/2005), policies such as national women policy, health policy and education policy have been integrating the gender perspective in their narrations. Moreover, all ministries have established departments of Women's Affairs in response to the broader government agenda to advance gender equality as evidenced by a National Action Plan on Gender Equality and recent gender responsive legislative reforms.

MoFED used its strategic position and its mandate to monitor and coordinate gender equality actions with regards to planning, resource allocations and expenditure. The fact that MoFED typically produces guidelines for various sectors for implementing budgets enabled it to move government commitments to gender equality into realization by developing gender responsive budgeting guidelines- Guidelines for mainstreaming Gender in the Budget Process. The document developed with support from the British Council and United Nations Children's' Fund (UNICEF) is to act as a further guide to all government ministries in mainstreaming gender perspectives into all budgeting processes. This guideline is anticipated to formally facilitate its acceptance and implementation across government.

From the NGOs or Civil Society Organization, two notable initiatives are: the NEWA initiative and the PBS initiative including its social accountability program. NEWA has undertaken diverse advocacy activities, monitoring of government compliance to commitments on gender equality and capacity building with government and other CSOs both locally and internationally. Beginning in 2007 a new activity for NEWA has been its actions to strengthen budget literacy for budget tracking amongst local communities targeting local women's organizations, women's associations, and devolved levels with Women's affairs bureaus and finance bureaus within sub-national government structures. All these government and civil
society bodies are the recipients of capacity building and training that is being supported through NEWA's activities.

The other interesting initiative is that of the PBS social accountability program. Ethiopia's Promoting Basic Services Program is to ensure the specificity and attainability of key result indicators across the education, health and water sectors, with a view towards enhancing eventual project outcomes.

PBS facilitates the expansion of extension workers in health and agriculture which has the potential to increase job opportunities for women and girls. Its second component is strengthening Local Accountability and Transparency Systems which involves public financial management and citizens' engagement.

The Social Accountability Program is part of the Promotion of Basic Services program (PBS), which is implemented at regional, woreda and kebele levels which has a direct impact on women. The Social Accountability is piloted in 85 woredas, increasing citizens' participation in monitoring access to quality basic services with feedback to service providers. The main purpose of the Social Accountability Program is to contribute to improved delivery and quality of basic services by strengthening the use and approaches of social accountability tools by civil society organizations, other non-state organizations, government officials and by service providers. One of these tools is GRB.

Although such initiatives are underway we shouldn't forget the rank, as Fetenu \& Sosena (2002) stated the implementation speed of these mainstreaming activities had not been as expected, as it remains slow (Geremew, 2007). Much still remains to be done to achieve the changes in budget allocations, changes in budget documents, mentions in budget speech, and increasing the use of gender responsive indicators.

### 2.7 Budget process in Ethiopia

Each country prepares its budget in accordance with its own specific conditions. In Ethiopia, the federal sectors prepare their annual budget with program budget preparation while regional states still follow the line item budgeting system. With developing the information communication infrastructure and other various system development efforts, Ethiopia is striding to roll out program budgeting nationwide.

## Budgeting Federal Sectors

Program budgeting is part of the civil service system service delivery reform. As it is still the norm in regional states, federal sector budgets used to be prepared in line with budgeting platforms from 1999E.C

- 2001 E.C program budgeting was piloted in selected federal sectors. In 2003 E.C the program budgeting initiative was upscaled in to all federal sectors.

After one year of practice the program budget was improved and recalibrated for full throttle practice.

The main goal of program budgeting is to focus resource allocation to specified results and to amplify the coordination between plan and budget as well as between capital and recurrent budget.

Program, formulation is the main tool for analyzing the budget and coordinating the recurrent and capital budget. Moreover, it is essential to evaluate and rate service delivery with facilitated infrastructure developments. Hence the program budget manual is developed by MoFEC so government institutions preparing their budget recognize their strategies, targets and activities.

Program budgeting is advantageous in:

1. Developing Sector budget
2. Making sure there is coordination between plan and budget
3. Comparing and contrasting plans with performance reports.

The following are the necessary ingredients for program budget practice

1. Three years strategic framework
2. Previous year performance report
3. Current year performance status
4. Base point for next year's plan
5. Next year's budget need:

Procedure-wise program budgeting follows three basic steps:

Step 1. Strategic performance framework: which is a three-year vision for infrastructure development and service delivery, contracted in the manner of time bound measurables and all in SMART.

Step 2. Goals, targets and three year expenditure estimate:- here is were the visions are turned in to specific targets with indicators and the three year expenditure estimate is calculated.

Step 3. Annual budget preparation: based on the above two steps.

Here is where annual resources are allocated for activities and inputs into those activities.

There are two main cycles

1. Planning Cycle
> Macro-Economic Fiscal framework
> Three-year expenditure estimate
> Annual fiscal plan
2. Budget Cycle
> preliminary Preparation by sectors
> Declaring budget endorsement/support for regions
> Budget call
> Budget hearing
> Preparing budget draft
$>$ Evaluating the budget draft by the council of ministers
> Presenting the budget draft to the House of Representatives.

## Regional States Budget Process

Regional status' budget focus on annual designed activities/projects and allocating resources for their implementation. It has four segments:
> Preliminary preparation by sectors
> Endorsement by peoples representatives/regional cabinet
> Implementation
> Audit/evaluation

## 1. Preliminary preparation by sectors

As the ministry of finance and economic cooperation is for federal sectors, the regional bureau of finance is mandated to consolidate sector bureau's budget requests and present them to the regional cabinet.

A consolidated and presentable budget should fulfill the following requirements:
> Identify budget/resource source
> Support for zones and woredas
$>$ Regional recurrent budget (source for covering recurrent cost)
$>$ Regional capital budget (source for covering capital budget)

Moreover the budget and finance affairs standing committee will comment on the draft budget.

## 2. Endorsement by regional parliament

There are three steps in the endorsement process:

1. Declaring budget support to woreda and zones
2. Regional Administrative Counsel evaluates the consolidated budget draft
3. The budget draft is endorsed/ratified

Unless there is a special order/grant, total government revenue is collected under one consolidated fund. The regional cabinet is mandated to administer that collected revenue based on the ratified budget.

The budget is ratified after each expenditure and is linked with its budget source. Other than that it is not the regional council's mandate to allocate detailed activities of sector departments.

## 3. Implementation

The regional Finance and Economic Development bureau will declare each sector's budget from the ratified consolidated regional budget. Based on this declared budget, sector bureaus will prepare action plans for their activities and send it to the finance and economic development bureau. The action plan portrays detailed and listed schedules for implementing plans and also enables performance evaluation.
4. Audit and monitoring

There is budget/performance monitoring since the implementation started. In addition, the budget is also audited at the completion phase of the fiscal year.

## Part Three

## 3. Findings of the assessment

## Findings in the Federal Sectors

## Federal Sectors respondents' profile

For this particular assessment, sector ministries and agencies had been chosen. The selected Ministries and Agencies were the Ministry of Education, Health, Agriculture, Water And Irrigation, Labor and Social Affairs, Urban Development and Housing, Justice, Ethiopian Road Authority and Federal Micro \& Small Enterprise Development Agency. The table below shows the respondent profiles.

| sex |  |  | Age |  |  |  | Educational background |  |  | department |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | female | male | 21-30 | 31-40 | 41-50 | $\begin{gathered} \text { over } \\ 50 \end{gathered}$ | Diplo ma | bache Ior | maste rs | Gende <br> $r$ <br> affairs | Plan <br>  <br> budge <br> t | Total No. <br> respo ndent s |
| Res pon den $t s$ No | 19 | 16 | 10 | 9 | 7 | 9 | 3 | 19 | 12 | 17 | 18 | 35 |
| Res <br> pon <br> den <br> ts in <br> perc <br> ent | 54.3 | 45.7 | 28.6 | 25.7 | 20 | 25.7 | 8.6 | 54.3 | 34.3 | 48.6 | 51.4 | 100\% |

Table 2: Federal sectors' respondent profiles.

## Conducive settings for the institutionalization of GRB in Federal sectors

There are several positive and encouraging factors in the institutionalization of GRB; among them is the presence of a gender affairs department in each sector that had been established by proclamation. These departments are meant to mainstream the gender agenda in their respective ministries in accordance with their sectors' mandate through trainings and monitoring \& evaluation. The gender affairs departments make an effort to incorporate the gender perspective in to the sectors' plans and implementations. Some ministries had also made gender sensitive statements in their sectoral mission that has a potential to create gender responsive sectoral plans. Moreover, there are also sectors that had developed a gender mainstreaming guideline specific to their sector.

The other positive factor is the commitment of some high-ranking officials' which can be taken as the political commitment of the government.


Fig 1: Respondents' exposure to GRB training

## Assessment findings

Out of the total respondents from federal sectors ( 35 in number), 27 of them ( 12 men, 15 women) had taken part in GRB training, while the rest (8 in total, 4 of each sex) had never attained a GRB training. Moreover, $48.5 \%$ of the responders are gender experts of whom $82.3 \%$ took the GRB while $51.5 \%$ of the respondents are planning and budget experts of whom 72.2\% took the GRB training.

Of those respondents who claimed they took the GRB training, $70 \%$ of them stated that the training equipped them with adequate knowledge and skill. Yet $21 \%$ of these individuals admitted that they hadn't practiced the knowledge \& skill they had acquired, with the pretext that the training methodology was not practical and exercises oriented, and also theere was limited time allocated for the trainings as in some cases the GRB training is blended with other unrelated topics fragmenting the trainee's attention.

Finally, the respondents claimed that the other contributing factor was the fact that in the planning and budgeting departments the division of tasks involved experts who were not trained in GRB and were assigned with the task of allocating the planning budget.

## Major challenges in the GRB implementation

As there are positive factors for the practice of GRB there were also several challenging factors. One of the major challenges that was raised by most was the attitudinal bias that pushes the responsibility of gender issues to women and provides them with the least attention. Other than the attitudinal preconception, the other challenge was the lack of skill and knowledge on gender responsive budgeting. On the other hand there is also limited commitment by experts as well as executives. Finally, on a practical note the sectoral plans and budgets are very poor in showing how those allocated budgets affect/ address the concern/need of men and women. Overall, on examination of the federal sectors' responses to the question "what are the challenges", $23 \%$ of them blame the unfavorable operational structure only. $86 \%$ of them find attitudinal bias to be the single problem for GRB practice. Similarly $86 \%$ of the respondents see limited skill and knowledge on GRB to be the challenge. The graph below presents the responses to identifying challenges to GRB practice.


Fig: 2 Challenges encountered in GRB practice

## Tools and monitoring \& evaluation systems in institutionalizing GRB

In the practice of the GRB which the majority of the sectors utilize, capacity building focuses on creating awareness of GRB trainings; empowering female workers/employees by providing scholarship programs; practicing affirmative action in employment; and, gender considerate monitoring \& evaluation. There are also exceptional approaches by sectors like the ministry of labor and social affairs which reject performance reports unless they clearly show gender issues with gender disaggregated data.

The respondents' answers suggest that there is a high probability of sustained GRB practice when there is strong monitoring and evaluation systems in place.


Fig: 3 Was your sector's previous year performance report gender inclusive?

With regards to current GRB practice, the majority of ministry sector respondents (91.4\%) relayed that their respective sector's previous year's plan had indeed incorporated gender issues. Similarly, the majority of them (91.4\%) confirmed that their sectoral department's performance report was gender considerate. However, in response to whether gender issues had been identified in their sector only $68.5 \%$ of them assured that they had, whilst the rest either admitted that their sector did not identify gender issues or that they were simply non responsive.

## Sectoral efforts to mainstream gender in the 2008 E.C budget

The majority of the subjects found their respective sectors to have made a good effort in mainstreaming gender in their sectoral plans. For instance, capacity building trainings in the ministry of agriculture which focused on enhancing agricultural production looks to involve more women farmers. Moreover in the safety net program which aims to support households to produce sustainable fixed assets, women were included in this by providing them with a business. Similarly, the 2008 E.C sector plan of the micro and small enterprise development agency had been giving similar attention to gender matters in its effort of creating jobs for the unemployed. In general, the majority of the assessment respondents of federal sectoral ministries found their respective sector to include gender issues in their 2998 E.C plan. The rest of the respondents had either stated that their sector did not consider gender (15.6\%) or they did not respond.

Of the sectors that had included mainstreaming gender in their plans, $60 \%$ of them established that their sector had identified gender needs and made a gender analysis to mainstream gender issues in their 2008E.C plan.


Fig. 4: Did your sector mainstream gender in the sectorial plan ?

On the other hand, $20 \%$ of them recognized their sector mainstreamed gender by incorporating it in propoor sector programs while only $2 \%$ of those who confirmed their sectoral plan was gender considerate, assured that their sector plan and budget had women specific programs.

With regard to which part of the budget or the sectoral plan incorporated gender:
17.2\% - program profile
$14.8 \%$ - in indicators
10.3 \% - in activities
34.5 \% - program profile, target, indicator, activity
$10.3 \%$ - program profile, activity
The assessment had also recognized that some sector ministries had made an effort to identify women's needs; the ministry of agriculture for example had identified women's needs in an agricultural extension program, natural resources conservation program and food safety net program. Interventions were designed to meet these women's needs. Similar efforts had also been conducted in the ministry of justice where the training of women and a needs assessment was held with an intent to address the skill and knowledge limitation of the female employees of the sector. Moreover, the ministry of justice had also
designed a legal aid protection for women and children. Federal sectors show promising progress in empowering their sectors' female employees by arranging (planning \& allocating budget) vocational trainings \& a scholarship program.


Fig 5: Are there women empowerment activities designed to address women employees in your sector?

Among the respondents, $65.6 \%$ of them said that their sector's strategic plan had women empowerment activities while only $31 \%$ admitted that their sector plan did not include such activitiesied that they did not know about the matter.

## Promising achievements in federal sectors' GRB practice

One of the best practices in federal sectors is the involvement of the gender affairs directorate in the sectoral planning process and its monitoring of sectoral departments to incorporate gender into their plan and budget as well as the commitment of sectoral heads in the gender mainstreaming endeavors.

There is also the good practice of planning to address women beneficiaries especially in job creation with numerical targets. All in all, it is apparent that if federal sectors had a strong monitoring and evaluation practice on GRB it would have been much easier to institutionalize GRB. The graph below shows the respondents' replies to a question concerning sector's gender indicators in action plans and monitoring \& evaluation checklists. $35.7 \%$ of those respondents stated that their sector did have gender indicators while $11.4 \%$ of them raised several inhibiting factors including lack of knowledge, an unconducive working structure or attitudinal bias to be the reasons why they did not include gender indicators in the monitoring \& evaluation checklist. Even though the majority of the respondents insisted that the monitoring \& evaluation checklist are gender inclusive the quantitative results of the assessment clearly indicate there
is still a significant gap in the gender responsiveness of the monitoring \& evaluation activity. Moreover, the respondents were requested to grade the institutionalization of GRB in their respective sectors.


Fig 6: Did your sector use gender indicators in the monitoring \& evaluation checklist and in the action plan?

Twelve grading questions were used to grade the institutionalization efforts. The first question graded the conclusive knowledge of their sector on gender responsive budgeting with $22.9 \%$ graded to be low, the majority (60\%) graded their sector as medium, and $8.6 \%$ graded it as high. The second question graded the gender responsiveness of the plan \& budget preparation of their sector. 11.4\% of them graded it low, $65.7 \%$ medium and $14.3 \%$ graded it high.

The other question was to grade the gender responsiveness of the budget cycle. 14.3\% gave it a low grade, 72\% a medium grade and 14.3\% a high grade.

The fourth question was concerned with the gender responsiveness of the previous year's 2008 E.C sector plan. $11 \%$ of the responders graded it low, $67 \%$ medium and $20 \%$ graded it as highly responsive.

They were also requested to grade the collaboration between their respective sector and the ministry of finance and economic cooperation in the GRB institutionalization effort. 33\% of them graded it as low while $38.6 \%$ graded it as medium and $22.1 \%$ found it to be high.

The sixth question was to grade the support of the gender affairs directorate in the practice of GRB; 25\% grade it as low, $33.7 \%$ as medium and $41.3 \%$ as high. On the other hand the sector heads commitment were graded as low by $33.6 \%$, medium by $47.9 \%$ and high by $18.6 \%$ of the respondents.

In ranking the budget allocated to women specific programs/ projects, $27.9 \%$ graded it as low, $55.7 \%$ of them graded it as medium and $16.4 \%$ stated that the budget was high.

The 9th question asked to grade equitability of the sector's service and activities in benefiting women and men. $21.4 \%$ graded it as low, $59.3 \%$ graded it as medium and $19.3 \%$ graded it as high.

On the other hand, respondents were asked to grade the budget and its capacity in addressing women's rights and upscaling their role; $46.9 \%$ graded it as low, $34.8 \%$ graded it as medium and $17.3 \%$ graded it as high.

With regards to grading the identification of gender issues in their sector, the majority (67.9\%) graded it as medium which $10.7 \%$ gave it low, and $21.4 \%$ high.

In conclusion, it is quite clear that the majority of the respondents found the GRB institutionalization effort to be mediocre.


Fig 7: Leveling GRB practice

- Lack of sex/ gender disaggregated data
- Lack of string and structured work flow that establishes accountability when it comes to GRB
- Absence of gender mainstreaming guideline in some sectors that would have been the basis for GRB practice
- Attitudinal bias that views GRB as extra work/burden and a complicated task
- Giving low attention to gender affairs/ issues along with attitudinal bias


## Proposed remedial actions

- Following the responders' own suggestion it has been highlighted that there is still a need for GRB trainings in training for trainers (TOT) and experience and best practice sharing workshops. In fact, the responders expressed their desire for a more in-depth and practice oriented training for a better and more meaningful gender mainstreaming. They also stressed that the training should also include the decision makers and women experts.
- There is also a critical need for accountability. Training and capacity building won't matter for some planners or budget experts unless an accountability structure is established.


## Findings in the selected Regional Sectors <br> Amhara National Regional State <br> Overview of the Region

The population of the Amhara region shows an annual growth of $1.98 \%$ which gives the total population size to 20.02 million as of $2013 / 14$. Regarding the settlement pattern, the overwhelming majority which is $84 \%$ of the population, resides in rural areas and is engaged mainly in agriculture. When we look at the age structure of the population, $40.4 \%$ are 14 years and under, while $4.2 \%$ of the population constitute greater than or equal to 65 years. Hence the young age dependency ratio is $72.9 \%$ and that of the old age is $7.7 \%$. This makes the societal dependency ratio as $80.6 \%$ (source regional census indicator).

Over the period of 2005/06 to 2013/14, there has been an annual increment in total revenue of the region. This may be due to the implementation of the new tax reform. However, the revenue covers only $24.66 \%$ of the expenditure in $2012 / 13$ and in $2013 / 14$ it covers $27 \%$ of the expenditure. Despite the increasing
tendency, the share of the revenue to the real RGDP remains insignificant. Therefore, by reforming the tax system and broadening the tax base will strengthen and contribute for the development of the region.

In the region, Agriculture remains to be the dominant economic sector. It is the major source of food, raw material for local industries and export earnings. The fact that the region is large in terms of area and endowed with diverse agro-ecology, leads it to have a huge potential for the production of a variety of agricultural products both for export purposes and domestic consumption. As a result, the sector has the potential to boost the economy and attention has duly been given by the government.

In the region, from July 8, 2010/11-July 7,2013/14 budget year, of the licensed 2,842 investors, their investment project capital is 60,422,997 birr and it creates a job opportunity for 505,474 people in total. Generally, according to the report of the Regional Industry and Urban Development Bureau, the investment capital and the number of projects shows incremental growth.

Although it is well endowed with a substantial amount of water resources potential, the performance of portable water supply and distribution is low. Based on the 2013/14 budget year data the regional water supply coverage did not exceed $77.92 \%$. This indicates that $22 \%$ of the population have no access to clean water. This coverage is also less than the standard set by the World Health Organization of a daily requirement of 45 liters/person.

Besides, women bear the burden of traveling long distances to fetch water, which further reduces their economic contribution. So far, in 2013/14 the water supply coverage of the region is estimated to be $77.92 \%$ ( $76.8 \%$ for rural and $84.5 \%$ for urban areas). This coverage seems to be a tremendous change as compared to 2012/13 (68\%) crude performances. However it still requires a great effort to change the situation of the rural household concerning portable water supply.

In the region, the total length of all-weather rural roads under the jurisdiction of the Ethiopian Road Authority is about 5491 ( $57.98 \%$ ) km and about 3980 km (42.03\%) is under the jurisdiction of the Rural Road Authority.

Currently in the region, there are about 398 kindergartens, 7,704 primary schools (1-8), 342 General Secondary Schools (9-10), 156 Preparatory Secondary schools (11-12), 10 Teachers' Training Colleges and 69 Government, 40 Private, 10 Polytechnic and Vocational Education and Training Colleges (TVET). The
number of students in primary education (1-8), general secondary education (9-10) and preparatory schools (11-12) were 4,086,650, 396,287 and 102,751 in 2013/14 respectively.

At the end of 2013/14 there were around 19 hospitals, 804 health centers and 3,317 health posts which were providing health services. On average, one health post provides for 6,035, one health center for 24,899 and one district hospital for 1,668,250 of the population.

## The status of Women in the Region

In the region, the majority of the population depend on agriculture and half of the population comprises women. The participation of women in political, social and economic activities would ensure sustainable and accelerated development. In general, the region's gender based inequality is deep rooted. Due to this, women's access to various social and economics services is found to be relatively low. Even if the participation of women in education is improving, there should be great effort to enhance women's participation in higher level education. On the other hand, women employment in governmental organizations is found to be only $36.8 \%$. Their access to political institutions like councils at all administrative levels remains low. Their participation in leadership positions, and professional work is low. Therefore, special attention should be given for capacity building for women.

As a result the general enrollment ratio in primary school was $92.8 \%$. Out of the total primary and secondary school students $49.4 \%$ and $51.9 \%$ were women respectively. This indicates that a small gender gap in primary and secondary education is still prevailing. Thus, appropriate measures should be taken to encourage female enrolment at all levels.

Maternal and infant mortality in Ethiopia as well as in the region is high relative to developed countries. Mother-child health services such as pre-natal, delivery, Post-natal and mother-child vaccination schemes have shown growth. However, when compared to the existing problem, the growth is not significant. According to the Regional Health Bureau report, among maternal health care services, pre-natal health care service coverage is $100 \%$ in $2013 / 14$, but delivery service coverage is $32 \%$. Less than five year mortality rate is 108 per 1000 live birth (CSA, 2010/11). The crude fertility rate in the region is 33 per 1000 population (CSA, 20014/15) and the average number of children a woman can bear during her reproductive life time is about 4 children (CSA, 2014).

In the region, to organize and use information about the number of civil service staff, type of service, sex, education level, and administrative levels, has a significant advantage for the regional development. With regards to employment of various services in the region, in 2013/14 the total number of employees reached 170,951 ; of these 107,964 were men and 62,987 were female.

## Findings of the assessment

The assessment study was conducted in eleven offices in the Amhara region. Out of the 32 professionals from the Gender, Planning and Budgeting department which participated in the study, 12 ( $37.5 \%$ ) were women and 20 (62.5\%) were men (see Chart 1).

## Respondents' profile



Fig 9 Sex and Educational level of respondents

Figure 9 shows the comparison between male and female participants of the gender, planning and budgeting department and their educational background. Of the men, 1 had a diploma (5\%), 12 had degrees (60\%) and 7 had a masters degree (35\%); of the women, 9 had degrees ( $75 \%$ ) and 3 had a masters degree (25\%).

Institutionalizing a Gender Responsive Budgeting system in the Region

In the region, based on the response of the questionnaire, gender is not entirely institutionalized in all bureaus. However, in some bureaus gender issues are being integrated. There is a significantly conducive
situation to mainstream gender issues in the budget and planning process which is the establishment of the gender affair office in sector bureaus. The majority of the assessed sector bureaus (63.6\%) have a gender office while the remaining sector bureaus (36.4\%) do not have a gender office.

Thus, one can infer that instead of establishing a new gender office, it is better to provide adequate gender awareness to the planning department. However, the survey questionnaire indicated that the majority of the planning, monitoring and evaluation experts did not utilize the gender responsive budget as they misunderstood the concept of gender and had been using it interchangeably with the term sex.

From the 11 regional sector bureaus which were selected for the assessment, the Educational Bureau, the Technical and vocational Enterprise Development Bureau, the Justice Bureau, the Agriculture Bureau, the Water Resource Bureau, the Amhara Credit and Saving Office (ACSO) and the Health Bureau have a gender office whereas the Transport Authority, the Industry and Urban Development Bureau, the Rural Road Authority and the Labor and Social Affair Bureau do not have an established gender office. For mainstreaming the issue of women and others disadvantaged society groups which need help, the regional Labor and Social Affairs Bureau has been responsible for mainstreaming gender issues and implementing the plan. The tasks which are covered by the planning as well as the monitoring \& evaluation experts are very unlikely to be gender responsive without adequate skills about gender responsive budgeting and gender mainstreaming. With regards to the bureaus which have a gender office, the office participates with the planning, monitoring and evaluation department when the annual report is prepared. Therefore, this has created a great opportunity to mainstream gender issues in planning and budget process.

The region has a conducive environment to institutionalize gender perspectives in the missions of sector bureaus to clearly include equal benefits for women. Some bureaus, included gender issues in their sector's mission implying that in both the planning and budgeting the sector bureau has given due attention to it. In this regard, the Amhara region Micro Finance Credit and Saving Institution (ACSI) can be taken as a major example.

The institution allows women to participate in different organizational structure as well as it has a guideline that entitles women to take the majority of the special credit service. Moreover, the institution gives priority to women in any service and hence this practice should be encouraged.

According to the Bureau of Health's planning and budget expert, in order to make the institution gender responsive, firstly the sector should assign gender experts to create a conducive opportunity and secondly, the experts should participate together for their budgeting and planning preparation. In addition, the institution enables women to perform tasks that make women beneficiaries in employment, promotion and job placement.

Another favorable environment is that in the Education Bureau with regards to the special support given to female students with low grades and further access to tutorials. Complementing this, the regional Bureau gender experts were working together with UNICEF donations to resolve early marriage which hinders female students who drop out of their education. The Bureau of Agriculture experts explain that they provided an encouraging condition for women by making them beneficiaries when projects and programs were appraised.

Among the Bureaus covered by the assessment study $81.8 \%$ of the bureaus did not prepare a gender mainstreaming guideline. However, some of the Bureaus have explained that they are preparing their own gender mainstreaming guideline and based on the guideline the job/task was implemented whereas technical and vocational development enterprise is preparing gender mainstreaming guideline with check list to benefit gender and disabled people.

In order to solve the bureau's/institution's problems, they used different implementation strategies. The majority of bureaus have provided trainings. They mainstream gender issues in their monitoring and evaluation systems, though it is not sufficient. The Bureau of Education gives training with collaboration by UNICEF giving awareness about the gender issues in all educational structures. The Transport Bureau is one of the bureaus which brought women to leadership positions. In the regional transport zones, three high level positions are held by women. In addition, the institutes used different strategies in order to make women beneficiaries of any service. Thus, the Rural Road Authority and Amhara Credit and Saving Institute (ACSI) are an example of this work. They include women to work in various poverty targeted sectors. One of the implementing strategies the Amhara Credit and Saving Institution has taken is incorporating gender responsive activities to give women sufficient skills in business management by provide training and experience sharing. As a result, women have received the majority of the services.

The participants also provided their opinion on how gender responsive budgeting capacity building training will be continued. Accordingly, the Bureau of Education's planning, budgeting and gender experts gave their opinion explaining that if they get training which enables them to develop their own selfconfidence and working skills in leadership (in structuring, planning and management) this bring them into leadership positions. In addition, the assessment study gender responsive budget training should be given to them and their managers to enhance their skill.

On the other hand, the health bureau experts said that training should be provided to managers with accountability, gender responsive budgeting training for accountants as well as the Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation should distribute a gender responsive budgeting manual guideline for the implementation of a gender responsive budget.

Accordingly, in the education bureau, the good experience gained at the end of the MDGs gave motivation to female teachers and students. In addition, when they strategize, they set goals and indicators to provide an equal opportunity for men and women with sex disaggregated data. According to the opinion provided by health bureau experts, the sector's strength is its completion of a gender audit and recently, the promotion of female professionals in the district and surrounding zones.

Moreover, they have expressed that even if efforts are done to bring women into leadership positions; women have faced problems. As it is found from the study, however, as the institution to resolve this issue, they organize women to make them educated and skill full working with integrating technical and vocational enterprises and other NGOs organizations. For example, they have created a market linkage in collaboration with various organizations. So, they provide opportunities when there are various development based business oriented jobs, and in integrating with Bureau of Agriculture they get input, credit and mobile banking as well as to make them advantageous of modern technology, it is known that also for youth they bought farm tractor to engage them in work.

In addition, the bureau provides educational opportunities for female students by facilitating a free education service from $9^{\text {th }}$ grade upwards to the completion of university. Moreover, after they have completed their education the institutions create employment opportunities to work in the institution; if they want to engage in business the institution will give a loan with its own guarantee. This best practice could be scaled up to others.


Fig 10: Capacity building training on gender responsive budgeting

In response to the question "have you participated in the capacity building training of gender responsive budget", gender, planning and budgeting experts responded that $43.8 \%$ of them replied yes, while $56.3 \%$ did not participate in the training. In response to the question "have you acquired adequate knowledge on gender responsive budget", 14 ( $37.5 \%$ ) of the respondents expressed that, yes, we acquire sufficient knowledge whereas 18 ( $18.8 \%$ ) stated that they had not acquired enough knowledge and the remaining $14(43.8 \%)$ did not respond. In addition, if the response was "Yes" for the questions "have you utilized the acquired knowledge/skill from the training to their own tasks" 8 (25\%) of them indicated that they have applied the knowledge whereas 7 (21.88\%) did not take to their own task and the remaining 43.8\% did not respond (See graph 3). For the question 3 if the response was " No ", they explained that the reason for not incorporating the knowledge gained from the training was due to a problem of awareness because of the training which is given for a short period.

## Challenges Faced while Implementing GRB

The major problem that was encountered in effective institutionalization of gender response budgeting is not preparing the guideline. The guideline is especially not prepared by bureaus that directly work with social issues like the Bureau of Labor and Social Affairs etc.... it has a wide chance for not given attention to gender issues in its office. In general, the preparation of the guideline implies that attention is given to
gender issues. It is clear when in the process of guideline preparation, gender analysis, gender disparity/gap and gender auditing shows the level of female held positions. Thus, this indicator helps to improve their level.

In relation to this, it is very difficult to institutionalize gender issues in all sector bureaus that do not have a gender affairs office and even if it the structure is present, they may not have adequate human resources. Therefore, this situation restricted the presence of gender issues in the budget process. In some sector bureaus, like other departments, the gender affairs office is not accountable to the bureau head.

The other problem is a problem of attitude. This problem can be divided into three levels. The first problem is the attitude of the leadership. From the head of the bureau up to the process coordinator level there is a similar attitudinal problem. This shows that the task for gender issues is additional work. In some sector bureaus, they though that the task is carried out by the planning, monitoring and evaluation department as additional work instead of organizing a gender office. The stand of Regional Women and Children's Bureau is also the same. However, when we see gender issues included in the planning and budgeting process at a grassroots level, the department does not give an adequate response. Another study showed that, the gender related issues are not included in monitoring, evaluation and checklists. In the view of the regional higher-level management bureaus, they have attitude problems to gender issues. They assume that gender issues are only for women and it is difficult to allocate a budget particularly for women. The third problem is generated from the women employees themselves. This includes fear of taking responsibility in higher positions, having feelings of dependency and a lack of awareness to institutionalize and implement gender responsive budgeting. In general, it can be explained that there is a good momentum to identify and resolve the gap of the attitude problem.

In the institutions which have a gender affairs office, inadequate budget for the office made it difficult to institutionalize gender responsive budget. The office has given technical support and awareness training in order to implement gender responsive budgeting in planning departments from top management up to planning experts but it needs an adequate budget. In some bureaus in the region they are not allocating a sufficient budget for the gender affairs offices. It is consequently difficult to implement and institutionalize gender responsive budgeting. At the same time, one of the challenges was the lack of information existing about women. For example, the Amhara Credit and Saving Institution has a challenge
to give a credit service by integrating the task in the planning process; however when evaluating the number of women and men, they put the data in percentage form rather than indicating a number because of the lack of sex disaggregated data. Similarly, this kind of problem is shown in the Labor and Social Affair bureau and the Water Resource Development Bureau.

Finally, turnover of the training professionals is a challenge to institutionalize gender responsive budgeting. Currently, the majority of the experts who are working in the planning, monitoring and evaluation department as well as the gender affairs office are not trained in gender responsive budgeting. Therefore, training should be given regularly to solve this problem.

Fig 11:- Problems which were encountered in implementing gender responsive budgeting


In regard to the challenges encountered during implementation of the, 4 (12.5) had experienced a problem of attitude, 2 (6.3\%) expressed a limitation of skill /Technical knowhow/ problem while 7 (21.9\%) of them encounter difficulty work system. The remaining 19 (59.4\%) were also did not responded (See graph 4).

## In 2015/16, mainstreaming gender issues in sectors planning and budgeting

It was seen from the assessment study that steps are being taken to empower women beyond professional training (especially bringing women into leadership positions). Accordingly, the planning and budgeting experts in the Education Bureau shows their effort encouraging female students who have a weak performance getting into tutorial class. They explain that in particular, they do the tasks integrated within the region by giving special attention and being prepared women education forum in strategic plan in special way to empower women and to protect from harmful traditions practices.

According to the Water and Sewage experts, women are empowered in capacity building which brings them into leadership positions. The assessment study response corroborates that they have benefited from water institution committee leadership and leadership positions in irrigation based on the guideline.

As can be understood from the assessment study, according to the technical and vocational enterprise development office, they also give training in leadership by using different structures. In the health extension office, the health bureau was given special capacity building training for managers and female experts who are working in the institution to empower them so that they can work as a deputy manager level in district health branches, and sometimes they work in top management levels in zones. Similarly, according to the Justice Bureau experts, women governmental employees and juries have favorable conditions for discussions and establishing associations.

With regards to this, the Credit and Saving Institution works to empower women in leadership. First, they recruited and employed female students who joined university directly without competition (without the competition of men) and among the experienced women staff they recruited, they assigned them to top finance manager for branch offices. Next, the institute works to provide capacity building to make them successful in their field of work and we can refer to this as an example that in the institution branch banks they are working as managers.

The selected sectors for the assessment study have given their opinion on the strength to mainstream gender responsive budgeting in the planning and budgeting process. Accordingly, for female students who have a better academic result they are giving an encouraging reward. When GTP was evaluated for educational participation and accessibility, capacity and equity and then analyzed with sex disaggregated
data by identifying the strength and weakness, the Bureau of Education experts responded that, they are trying to mainstream gender issues in the planning of GTP 2.

As the assessment study shows, the Rural Road Authority explains that in the job creation plan, they have identified clearly the share of women and youths required, and their performance. Moreover, the Authority have identified gender issues by preparing guidelines and based on this guideline, the department and management implemented changes. Similarly, the health bureau has assigned gender experts, to mainstream gender issues in any proposed strategic plans as well as annual plans based on this; it is compiled the performance report quarterly.

The Credit and Saving Institution gives special attention to women in order to integrate gender issues when they are preparing its plan. The institution has evaluated its performance based on the allocated separate budget. For example, from the fiscal budget year, the highest loan share was given to women; in $2015 / 16$ it has tried to give $70 \%$ of the loan and $50 \%$ of the collected savings to women.


Fig 12 : The mainstreaming of gender issues in the previous year's performance evaluation and in performance reports

The graph shows whether the sector/institution has taken into account gender issues in the previous year's performance evaluation; 28 (87.5\%) of them responded that it is included while 3 (9.4\%) explained
that it is not included, and the remaining 3 (3.1\%) did not respond. Similarly, in question 7, the performance report which is prepared by the institution's department shows that the majority of the respondents 27 ( $84 \%$ ) replied that it is included whereas 4 (12.5\%) of the respondents replied that it is not included. 1 (3.1\%) did not respond.


Fig 13:- Whether gender issues are identified and mainstreamed adequately in the institution 2015/16 plan and budget.

As is shown in graph 6 in response to the question regarding the inclusion of gender issues in the sector/institution, 24 (75\%) of the experts responded that gender issues were identified whereas 2 (6.3\%) responded that the issue was not identified while 6 (18.8\%) of the respondents did not know. Similarly, in response to the question as to whether the 2008 plan and budget of the sector/institution adequately addresses the gender issue, 20 (62.5\%) of the experts responded "Yes" that the gender issue was adequately included while (28.1\%) explained that it was not adequately included. 9 (3.1\%) replied that they did not know.

Graph 7
In the institute incorporated gender issue in 2015/16 budget/budget allocation

Fig 14- The institute incorporated gender issues in the 2015/16 budget allocation

In response to the way in which gender issues are to be performed in the 2015/16 budget allocation, 12 experts (37.5\%) responded that they were allocating a separate budget for women only, 11 (34.4\%) would base the budget on men and women and consequently they need gender disaggregated analysis and 9 (28.1\%) explained that the budget would give an emphasis on gender issues in pro poor sector budget allocations (See graph 7).

Is it included in the strategic plan of the institution/sector to empower women employees and to give special professional training?


Fig 15

As graph 8 indicates, in response to the question "Is it [gender] included in the strategic plan of the institution/sector to empower women employees and to give special professional training," the majority, 17 (53\%), of the gender, planning and budgeting experts responded that it is included in the strategic plan while $9(28 \%)$ responded that it is not included in the strategic plan whereas the remaining 6 (19\%) did not respond.

Similarly, in response to the question as to whether the institution/sector identifies the needs of women in the fiscal year plan:
> They explained that, the policy stipulated four strategic focus areas in terms of the quality of education initiatives program; the plan was identified and constructed in view of benefits participation of women.
> According to the water and sewage experts' opinion, it was planned to reduce the workload of women by increasing the water supply and reducing the distance by making it more accessible to provide clean and safe drinking water. In the irrigation sector, starting from project design in construction, job opportunities, short and long training and awareness creation activities for women beneficiaries etc.
> As the assessment study indicates, the bureau of Agriculture experts also planned to include the needs of women by incorporating ways to specifically benefit female headed households and jobs are done with new technologies.
> By providing job opportunities in rural roads, equal payment for men and women and by giving encouragement to women in employment and recruitment, as well as technical and vocational development, the planned job creation is $51 \%$; $60 \%$ in the market chain; $60 \%$ supplying a loan for marking; industrial extension support $40 \%$; technical and vocational training $55 \%$ and loan supplying $60 \%$ to benefit women.

## Strategies to institutionalize GRB

Monitoring and evaluation is required to check the implementation of plan activities from the initial point. Most of the regional sector offices include gender issues in their annual plans. Thus, to identify problems and in order to give solution to the performance process of the sectors, one must follow their own monitoring and evaluation system; this monitoring and evaluation system in some sectors is performed in the planning, monitoring and evaluation department while in others sectors it is performed in another
department. For example, in the Rural Roads Authority the monitoring and evaluation is carried out in operational divisions. In all sectors, it can be said that the gender department have its own monitoring and evaluation system. The Amhara Credit and Saving Institution is one of the best institutions in terms of monitoring and evaluation in the assessment study. Despite this, the institution is administered by board members and has its own working procedures to benefit women; Even if in the zones they have gaps in monitoring and evaluation. The main office and selected branch offices evaluate the performance and give feedback every six months. At the zonal level, the department monitored and evaluated the performance from a grassroots perspective.

The Justice Bureau evaluates the performance plan and gives a feedback twice a year at the zonal level and four times a year at the woreda level. In the region, the Agriculture and Water Resource Bureaus also provide feedback. Though there is a monitoring and evaluation system, it is difficult to take gender issue as one aspects of the evaluation process in all sectors. In most offices, in the gender check list the gender issue is not included clearly. The region has a lot of work to do to ensure equal benefit for women and men and to organize the gender department and involve gender in the planning process.

As the assessment study indicates when the plans are prepared they are based on the guideline, the performance report is evaluated quarterly and it is monitored by field trip and feedback has been given. In addition, in hospitals there are women forums so that the gender focal staff monitored the task based on the guideline.

Fig 16: Are genders issues indicators included in action plan, monitoring and evaluation documents?


As Fig 16 shows, in response to the question as to whether gender issue indicators are included in the action plan, monitoring and evaluation documents when it is utilized, 25 ( $78.1 \%$ ) responded yes, it is included while $7(21.9 \%)$ responded that it is not included. In relation to this, the reason that it is not included is most of the experts' 7 (84.4\%) did not respond whereas 1 ( $3.1 \%$ ) explained limited skill and attitude problems and 5 (9.4\%) claimed that it was due to a working deficiency.

## The quantitative view of Institutionalization of Gender Responsive Budgeting

Generally, in the regional sector office, questions were developed to assess the overall condition of the main issues of the gender responsive budget to institutionalize it in those selected sectors; the conditions were rated as low, medium or high. Thus, the result of this analysis is shown below in graph 10:-

Fig 17: The Overview of the institutionalization of Gender Responsive Budgeting in selected Sectors


As it is understandable from Graph 10, as it is requested in question 1, in general, in the sector/institution how do you rate the level of awareness of the gender responsive budgeting, based on this question the response for the gender, plan and budget experts are $29 \%$ of the respondent replied low level while (61.3\%) explained medium level. Similarly, the remaining $9.7 \%$ indicated higher level.

Question 2-The response for the requested question, how much is your sector plan and budget description responsive to gender responsive budgeting is $23 \%$ of the respondent replied low level while, $60 \%$ expressed middle level whereas $17 \%$ of the respondents indicated high level.

Question 3- The response for the requested question, how would you rate the gender responsiveness of the budget cycle (from budget request up to monitoring and evaluation) is $50 \%$ of the respondents responded low level while $30 \%$ of the respondent give their opinion as medium level. $20 \%$ of the experts who filled the questionnaire also indicated high level.

Question 4- According to the experts response for the requested question how would you rate the gender responsiveness of your sector 2015/16 budget year plan, 22.6\% replied low level while 51.6\% expressed medium level whereas $25.8 \%$ of the respondent indicated high level.

Question 5- For the requested question, how would you rate the collaboration of MoFED and your sector in the implementing gender responsive budget, $65.5 \%$ of the respondent indicated low level, $24.1 \%$ replied medium level, $10.4 \%$ of which mentioned high level.

Question 6-As the expert response shows for the requested question, how you would rate the support for your sector gender affaires office in implementing gender responsive budgeting 43.3\% replied low level, $50.0 \%$ indicated medium level and $6.7 \%$ mentioned high level.

Question 7- The response for the requested question, how would you rate the commitment of sector's leadership in implementing gender responsive budgeting 41.9\% replied low and medium level whereas $16.2 \%$ also indicated high level.

Question 8- According to the opinion of the respondent for the requested question, how would you rate the budget allocated to women specific projects, $53.3 \%$ responded low level whereas $26.7 \%$ also expressed medium level while the remaining $20 \%$ replied high level.

Question 9- The responses for the requested question from the general budget allocated to your sector how would you rate the equitable benefit between men and women, $22.6 \%$ replied low level while 48.4\% mentioned medium level whereas $29 \%$ indicated high level.

Question 10- The respond for the question, how would you rate the budget allocation with regard to securing women rights and promoting their role, $41.9 \%$ of the respondent explained low and medium level $16.2 \%$ indicated high level.

Question 11- The response for the requested question, how would you rate the level of identification of gender issues in your sector, $32.3 \%$ expressed low and medium level while $35.4 \%$ also replied high level. Besides, Question 12 indicates, the experts response for the requested question, rate the level of gender incorporated into your sector's planning and budgeting, $29 \%$ of the respondent expressed while $48.4 \%$ medium level and $22.6 \%$ high level.

## Recommendations to institutionalize GRB

> Empower women
> The leadership should have a common understanding to mainstream gender issues.
> Strengthening the monitoring and evaluation system.
> Access extensive training on gender perspectives
> Prepare awareness creation workshops for the community about gender issues.
> The gender department must be a member of management in the institution and should be able to give their own point of view in the evaluation process.
> Institutional analyses of women should be assessed to ensure that how many of them are benefiting.
> Gender Affairs office should be organized in all offices up to the woreda level.

## Dire Dawa city Administration

## Overview of the city administration

Dire Dawa is one of two city administrations in the nation located at the eastern part of Ethiopia bordering the Ethiopian Somali \& Oromia regional states. The city administration is structured by 9 urban as well as 21 rural kebeles covering an area of 128,802 hectares. According to the 2007 CSA census the city encompasses 341,834 residents of whom 171,461 are male and 170,373 are female inhabitants in 72,937 households. Furthermore, the 2011 CSA's DHS reports that the fertility rate is on average 3.4. Accordingly, the 2015 population has projected to be 434,813 with the youth comprising $31.6 \%$ of which $51.5 \%$ are female.

With regards to the educational net enrolment rate, the 2011 DHS reports the attendance rate in $1^{\text {st }} \mathrm{cycle}$ /primary school is $77.5 \%$ for boys and $72.0 \%$ for girls. Whereas the 2014 mini DHS shows the rate had climbed to $77.9 \%$ for boys but descended to $71.6 \%$ for girls. In 2011, the second cycle/ secondary school net enrollment rate was $32.9 \%$ for boys and 24.4 for girls. However, as of 2014 the net enrollment rate became $24.3 \%$ for men and $28.4 \%$ for girls. The total gender parity index in school attendance in 2014 had been reported as 0.92 for primary school and 1.16 for secondary school due to its geographical location (being that it is a mainstreaming for the railway passing for Djibouti to Addis) trade and economic activities are prevalent. The 2011 report showed that the employment rate for men was $78.2 \%$ whereas it was $40.2 \%$ for women. In this regard, among the employed men about $26.84 \%$ are engaged in agriculture and $23.7 \%$ on trade while the majority of the women (67.3\%) are engaged in trade activities.

According to 2014's mini DHS report the health coverage has shown increments in health center birth from $39.7 \%$ in 2011 to $58.4 \%$ in 2014. The under-five child mortality rate which is 97 per 1000 births is still low in comparison with other regions of the country.

## Women's status in the city administration

As it is highlighted in the previous section, according to the 2011 DHS report, some of the efforts of working towards gender equality have brought promising results.

For instance, the 2011 DHS report indicates that women's land ownership either alone or together with their spouse constitutes about $39.9 \%$ while $59.4 \%$ men hold land ownership either alone or together.

On the other hand, decision making power in households including on household income has shown that $51.4 \%$ of the women have sole power whereas $44 \%$ of them engage in collective decisions they share with their husbands. This makes Dire Dawa the second in the country next to Addis Ababa.

As compared with other parts of the country, the gender disparity in Dire Dawa is perceived as best; it should however be stressed that there is data that alert a coordination need to ensure the welfare of the women. For example, according to the DHS 2011 report only $58.3 \%$ of women are aware of the law regarding domestic violence.

## Major findings of the assessment

The Gender responsive budgeting assessment which has been conducted in Dire Dawa city administration looks at its implementation in different sectors. Accordingly, ten sector bureaus have been assessed; including, health, education, labor \& social affairs, urban development \& construction, justice, finance and economic development, land administration, agriculture \& water, small and micro enterprises agency and microfinance as well as the Dire Dawa credit association. The assessment has chosen relevant experts mainly working in the area of gender, planning and budget. Unlike other regions, the structure of the bureaus in Dire Dawa city administrations is different and some of the bureaus such as water \& sanitation have been merged with agriculture. Moreover, considering its relevance for gender equality, the assessment had also included the land administration office.

Among the requested participants there were some experts who did not respond due to unavailability (especially those experts in road authority, education and health bureaus); in addition, others could not respond because they were new on the job. However, $70 \%$ of respondents filled out the questionnaires for the assessment.

From those who responded to the questionnaire, $60.9 \%$ are planning $\&$ budgeting experts whilst the rest of the respondents (39.1\%) are gender and HIV focal persons. On the other hand, 60.9\% of the respondents are men and $39 \%$ of them are women. With regards to the educational status of respondents, $73.8 \%$ are first degree holders, $17.4 \%$ second degree holders and the rest $4.3 \%$ are diploma holders.


Fig 18: Respondents by work division


Fig 19: Respondents by Sex

## Gender responsive budgeting's institutionalization in Dire Dawa

The 2013 assessment by MOFEC conveyed that Dire Dawa's sector bureaus' annual plans were gender sensitive. The finance and economic development bureau sends the budget call along with a checklist that encourages sectors to produce a gender responsive budget, to consider gender issues while developing projects, to advance the mainstreaming gender into their core tasks. Furthermore, the assessment also identified the challenges of GRB practice such as a low commitment and the attitudinal bias towards gender.

The 2013 assessment had also noted that about $56.1 \%$ of respondents consider their sector's plan as moderately gender responsive whilst $14.6 \%$ consider the plan as not being gender responsive. Similarly, $51.2 \%$ of the respondents agreed that the leadership commitment towards GRB implementation is moderate whereas $22 \%$ believe it is low.

This 2015 assessment shows the previous efforts to institutionalize GRB has continued. For example, one of the evaluation criteria for budget requests from sector bureaus is gender inclusivity.

Similarly, efforts made by different sectors include:

- The inclusion of gender issues in their strategic plan;
- Identification and consideration of gender needs into their plan;
- Inclusion of gender issues in their performance report;
- Developing human resource strategies to improve the participation of women and to emphasize capacity building;
- Engagement of men in the process of ensuring gender equality;
- Promoting advocacy and sensitization on gender issues;
- Efforts made by different sectors to include gender aspects in the planning and reporting process by signing a memorandum of understanding.

In this assessment 52.2\% of the respondents replied that they have been trained in GRB of which 30.4\% are planning and budget experts. In the process of institutionalizing GRB, the role of the experts' knowledge about gender issues is very crucial. In this regard, the aforementioned number of trained experts on GRB could be regarded as low. This conclusion affirms the fact that the majority of the respondents believe that limited knowledge on GRB is the greatest hindrance to its implementation.


Figure 20. Responses to questions 1, 2 and 3 on gender responsive budgeting

Question 1. Have you ever attended training on gender responsive budget?

Question 2. Did you gain adequate knowledge/awareness from the training?

## Question 3. Did you utilize the knowledge and skill you gained from the training?

From those who had been trained in GRB, about $72.7 \%$ of the respondents have replied that they received adequate knowledge. From these respondents about 43.5\% of them are just trying to implement their knowledge. As was pointed out in the previous sections, the importance of training for institutionalizing GRB is extremely important. Nonetheless the statistics in this paragraph make it clear that training by itself won't be the solution.

As one of the respondents clearly puts it
". . . . Of course, the training by itself could not suffice. Those gender responsive plans are realized only after implemented and reported."

The respondents had also been requested to evaluate their respective sectors on the level of GRB institutionalization. In this regard, the following inferences are drawn from the quantitative information:
> When respondents rated their sector's knowledge on GRB, $65 \%$ believe that the knowledge was at a moderate level, whereas $25 \%$ replied that the level was low.
$>$ Regarding the gender responsive planning and budgeting status, respondents ranked their sector's plan and accordingly $65.2 \%$ believe it was moderately gender responsive and $20 \%$ stated that it was highly responsive.
> Regarding the collaboration between the ministry of finance and economic development and their own respective sector, $39.1 \%$ believe that there was a low collaboration while $30.4 \%$ thought that the collaboration was moderate and $4.3 \%$ of them believe it is high collaboration. The rest 26.1\% did not responded.

- In evaluating their sector's budget practice to the projects and programs that are specifically designed for women, $39.1 \%$ believe the practice was at a low level, $30.4 \%$ thought that the practice was moderate, $4.3 \%$ thought the practice was at a high level while $26.1 \%$ did not respond
- The last evaluation point was to evaluate their sector's leadership commitments on gender affairs. Thus, $33.3 \%$ thought that the commitment was low, $44.4 \%$ thought that the commitment was moderate and $22.2 \%$ thought that the commitment was high.

According to the assessment made in 2013 on GRB implementation status, 14.6\% of the respondents believed the planning process was not gender responsive whilst $56.1 \%$ thought that it was moderate and 21.9\% thought that it was highly gender responsive.

In this current assessment it was observed that in the previous budget/fiscal year, gender was taken as an evaluation criteria in each sector's performance report.

Accordingly, 95.2\% of the respondents stated that their sector's performance report had included gender issues of which $81.8 \%$ of the respondents believed that their department's performance report was gender considerate.


Fig 21. Responses to questions 4, 5, 6 on the inclusion of gender issues in performance reports

Question 4. Did the institution identify gender issues?

Question 5. Did your institutional performance review consider gender issues?

Question 6. Does your institution's performance report include gender issues?

For effective mainstreaming of gender in the plan, one of the critical and primary tasks is to identify the gender issues of the sector. With this regard $56.5 \%$ of the respondents stated that their sector had
identified gender issues whereas $13 \%$ admitted that their sector did not identify gender issues; the rest, $30.4 \%$, have not responded to this question. From the sectors which have identified gender issues, experts were asked to rank the level of gender issue identification. Accordingly, $55 \%$ of the respondents considered the identification to be at a moderate level while $30 \%$ described the level as low.

About $65.2 \%$ of the respondents believed that gender issues were included in 2015/16's annual plan of which $34.8 \%$ confirmed gender needs were identified and became part of the annual plan. $21.7 \%$ of the respondents stated that gender perspective had been seriously taken into consideration especially in propoor sector projects /programs.


Figure 22. Responses to questions 7, 8 and 9 on the incorporation of gender

Question 7. Did the 2015/16 plan adequately mainstream gender aspects?

## Question 8. Did the action plan, monitoring \& evaluation reports incorporate gender issues?

Question 9. Did the strategic plan of the institution incorporate women empowerment activities?

Even though regional states did not make a shift to program based budgeting, sectors including the finance and economic development bureau, are using gender aspects as evaluation criteria in the plan preparation and project /program identification process.

The table below shows the parts of the plan where gender has been incorporated.

| Component of the plan | Respondents <br> in $\%$ |
| :--- | :--- |
| 1. | Activity |
| 2. | Indicator |
| 3. | Program Description |
| 4. | Target |
| 5. | Targets, indicator and activity |
| 6. | Target and activity |
| 7. | In all |

Table 3 Components of the plan which have incorporated gender
Due attention should also be given to the monitoring \& evaluation process. Accordingly, the majority of the respondents ( $76.2 \%$ ) confirmed that gender had been considered in the monitoring \& evaluation indicators. The rest of the respondents ( $23.8 \%$ ) admitted that gender aspects weren't part of the monitoring \& evaluation process due to attitudinal bias and an inconvenient work structure. In ranking the overall stance of the 2015/16 plan through the gender lens, $60.9 \%$ of the respondents thought that it performed at a moderate level, $17.4 \%$ thought that the level was above average and $8.7 \%$ thought that the level was below average.

Regarding the effort of sectors to enable female workers to contribute to major tasks, the assessment has shown that the majority of the sector bureaus attempted to coordinate their gender office/ gender focal person, their sector's human resources department and the women and children affairs bureau to empower their female employees. One of the tasks that had been embraced in the sector plans was to organize vocational trainings. In addition to this, other tasks involved working on capacitating women for decision making positions, trainings on leadership, scholarship programs and accolades given to top female workers. Nonetheless, some of the assessment respondents (26.1\%) had proclaimed that female empowerment had been deserted in their sector.

## Challenges to institutionalize GRB

Since GRB as a concept as well as a strategic component is new, various challenges and obstacles might be frequently faced. Besides its novelty, the matter of gender is a part and parcel of human culture making the transformation become difficult and as well as low process.

In this assessment, the other area investigated was the challenges faced by experts to translate the theoretical knowledge they have gained through trainings into the institutionalization of GRB. The majority of respondents from Dire Dawa attributed attitudinal bias to be the major hindering factor. Attitudinal bias is a common deterring factor raised in many gender platforms found in other assessments. Common sense dictates that training is an important tool to tackle this attitudinal bias and yet more should obviously be done to address the matter. This is because workshops and seminars alone do not suffice to bring about equality. Consequently, one of the respondents put it as
". . . . . GRB training by itself isn't enough. Every sector should fashion an accountability structure that makes the responsible person accountable."

Putting the responses into numbers, out of those who had been trained in GRB about 47.8\% of them claimed attitudinal bias as the major challenge while $36.4 \%$ believed that an inconvenient work structure was to blame and the rest considered a lack of skill as well as a lack of commitment as the major hampering factors. Another challenge raised concerned the focal person/people that are supposed to coordinate and lead the gender mainstreaming tasks in their respective sectors;
"Gender issues (mainstreaming tasks) are left to be covered by the focal person alone, with majority of them having other major duties which will take up of their time and attention. For those focal people, which happen to be devoted to do more, they neither have the mandate/power nor technical capacity".


Fig 23. Challenges in GRB practice

## Recommendation

With regards to the assessment on Dire Dawa city administration, the following remedial actions are proposed to tackle the challenges that are faced in the process of institutionalizing GRB.

- There should be a collaborative effort between the bureau of finance \& economic cooperation and the bureau of women and children affairs to resolve the challenges raised by organizing technical and attitudinal trainings.
- With the aim of trickling down the technical and theoretical knowledge required to practice GRB, it is mandatory to provide a ToT on GRB for every sector and those ToT trainees should take the responsibility to train planners and budget experts in their respective sectors.
- Due attention should be given to those departments and focal people in each sector so as to adequately perform their tasks.

The role of the bureau of finance \& economic development on the institutionalization of GRB is critical. The monitoring and evaluation of sector planning \& budgeting as well as programs \& projects should be continued and continued in its strength.

## Tigray Regional State

## Overview of the Region

The Tigray region is one of the nine regional states in Ethiopia which is located in the northern corner with a coverage area of 50286 square kilometers. Based on the 2007 census, the projection of the regional population was made in 2012. Accordingly, about 4.9 million people are living in the region. From this, women constitute about 2.5 million (50.8\%) whereas about 2.4 million (49.2\%) are men.

When we assessed the educational enrolment in the region in 2014, the net enrolment in primary school for girls and boys were $85.1 \%$ and $73.9 \%$ respectively. Similarly, in secondary school enrolment, the net enrolment of girls was $31.1 \%$ whereas boys' enrolment was only $17.8 \%$. As a result, gender disparity in primary and secondary school enrolment became 1.15 and 1.74 respectively. The above quantitative aspect revealed that the government's effort to enhance girls' educational enrolment had succeeded though there is still a further struggle to unleash women's potential.

In the Tigray region, the livelihood of the people mainly depends on agricultural activities. In 2012 the gross value addition for agricultural production accounts for $34.7 \%$ whereas the share of the industry was 22.5\%.

The regional government has been performing different tasks to improve the primary health coverage. As a result, in 2012 about 18 new hospitals began to function and 226 health centers as well as 157 private clinics became operational. On the other hand, one of the quality indicators for a health service is the availability of health workers especially doctors and nurses to their population ratios. In this regard, a doctor to population and a nurse to population ratio was 47,652 and 1,760 respectively. This indicates that the nurse to population ratio is quite satisfactory while the need for doctors' still requisite the government to take further steps.

The regional access to portable water supply on average reached $65 \%$ in 2012 . For that matter, the regional bureau of water has taken an integrated approach to water resource development.

In general, the government's strategy to bring broad based, accelerated and sustained economic growth in the region has begun to realize significant social and human development.

## The Situation of Women in the Region

According to the 2014 Demographic and Health Survey (DHS) report, about 26.5\% of births occur in public health centers whereas only 0.2 \% occur in private health centers. The remaining $72.3 \%$ of women deliver
in their homes. The proportion of birth attendants in health centers increased from $11.6 \%$ in 2011 to 26.7\% in 2014.

The initiative to expand accessible basic education for women has continued. As a result, in 2013 about 84.5\% of school age girls were enrolled in the region. In addition to this, various awareness programs have been undertaken and consequently about 55,310 mothers began to attend alternative basic education.

The remarkable improvement that has been envisioned in the agricultural sector in the region started to benefit female-headed households especially in activities like crop production, natural resource conservation and utilization, agricultural extension services and livestock production. For instance, in 2013 about $82.6 \%$ of women participated and benefited from natural resource conservation activities. Similarly, in the same period, 15,205 female-headed households received a credit service.

Generally, significant achievements toward benefiting women in the region have been in place. Thus, in line with Ethiopian women's policy and packages, women's development armies were formed and started to ensure their active participation in health, education, agricultural and other related areas.

## 1. Major Finding of the Assessment

### 1.1 General Profile of the Respondents

In this assessment, different respondents participated from various sectors such as the bureau of agriculture, the bureau of health, the bureau of education, the water and sewerage authority, the bureau of labor and social affairs, the transport and road authority, the bureau of urban development, the micro and medium enterprises agency, the bureau of justice and the bureau of finance and economic development. General information about the respondents including their age, educational status and job position are described as follows.

Table 4: General profile of respondents

|  | sex |  | Age |  |  |  | Educational Status |  |  | Department |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Respondent <br> S | female | Male | 21-30 | 31-40 | 41-50 | >50 | Dipl | Degr | Mast | Gende <br> r <br> Affairs | Budge <br>  <br> plan |
| Share in \% | 53.6\% | 46.4\% | 17.9\% | 28.6\% | 32.1\% | 21.4\% | 7.1\% | 75\% | 17.9\% | 25\% | 75\% |

Fig 24: Have you ever had training on gender responsive budgeting?


Since 2012, the Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation's gender affairs directorate have been conducting GRB trainings and creating awareness among the planning, budget and gender experts at federal and regional levels. Among the sectors that GRB assessment was conducted, $57.1 \%$ of experts who are working in the budget and gender affairs office have trained on gender responsive budgeting. From those experts $46.4 \%$ said that the training was very essential for them specially to correct misconceptions about gender and helped them to be aware about key concepts related to gender responsive budgeting. On the other hand, about $21.1 \%$ of respondents who took part in the GRB training respond that they had not received enough knowledge because the trainings periods were too short and lack continuity. The remaining $32.1 \%$ did not respond to the question.

The respondents also raised different issues regarding the implementation process. Though they participated in training and were equipped with the necessary skill, they couldn't apply it because of the following reasons:

- Weak synergy among planning/budgeting experts and gender experts as well as an absence of continuity of training for the experts to build their capacities;
- Due to budget constraints, training on GRB was not given to officials; and so this hinders the ability to fully practice the initiative;
- Since gender responsive budgeting is a new initiative, experts have not yet captured it very well;
- Generally, because of the attitudinal problem people usually regard the issue as just a women's problem.

Contrastingly, there are about $42.9 \%$ of respondents who tried to implement gender responsive budgeting in their sectors though they have encountered many challenges. They mention that the practical exercises applied during the training sessions helped them to relate to the theoretical aspects of existing gender issue in their sectors.

### 1.2 Major Challenges while trying to Practice GRB in the Region



Fig 25 Challenges encountered when trying to practice GRB in the Tigray Region
The above figure shows the major challenges that practitioners face after having enough knowledge on GRB. Thus, let us look closely at each of the challenges.

Attitudinal Problem: Society's attitudinal problem towards gender has a negative impact on the GRB implementation process. In this regard, experts that work in different sectors have a problem of looking at gender as just a women's problem and tend to ignore GRB aspects in the planning and budget process. The other attitudinal problem is from considering GRB as just allocating a separate budget for women and/or a budget for the gender affairs departments.

Skills Gap: The GRB trainings usually conducted are ran in a fragmented way and has a little effect in reaching the gender equality goal. In this regard, the assessment outcome has shown that about $17.9 \%$ of
the respondents think that there is a skill gap among experts since the trainings lack continuity and accommodates only a few experts.

Lack of a Conducive Environment to implement GRB: The budget allocated for the gender affairs departmental activities is apportioned to support in pool budget making the gender directorate dependent on others plan. Therefore, $10.7 \%$ of the respondents agreed that paying just a little attention to the department hindered it from undertaking rigorous follow up and evaluation.

In addition to these comments, the respondents revealed that there are many challenges faced while implementing GRB. Since GRB is a new concept it takes time to internalize it; also, a high turnover of trained public servants are among major challenges related with GRB implementation.

### 1.3 On-going Efforts to Practice GRB in the region

Fig 26

$\mathrm{Q}_{6}$. Does the performance report of each department incorporate gender aspect?
$\mathrm{Q}_{7}$. Does the 2015/16 plan of the sector considered gender aspects adequately?
Q. ODoes the action plan and monitoring \& evaluation documents contain GRB indicators?
Q. Does the organizational strategic plan document address the women empowerment aspect?
$Q_{13}$. Does the strategic plan document set a target to provide skill training for women stuffs?
$Q_{17}$. $Q_{8}$. Do the action plan and monitoring \& evaluation documents contain GRB indicators?
The efforts to build the capacity of the regional sector's bureau budget and gender experts by the gender affairs directorate of the ministry of finance and economic cooperation has played a great role especially in filling capacity gaps and bringing attitudinal change. In this regard, this assessment identified the efforts made to institutionalize gender responsive budgeting in the region. Therefore, about $82.1 \%$ of the organizations that the assessment made responded that evaluation had been made on each department's plans and performance reports whether gender issues were addressed or not. And if the plan and performance report does not incorporate gender aspects, it will not be accepted.

So far, different achievements on GRB's work has been materialized in the region. In the education sector, different activities have been performed to enhance girls enrollment. For instance, girl students used to suffer due to an absence of separate restrooms. However, the government has taken a series measure to construct separate toilets in every school and this has helped to lower girls' dropout rate. In addition to this, the regional government has been doing plenty of activities to empower female teachers including providing both long-term and short-term trainings for them.

In the health sector, women friendly activities have been undertaken such as providing health services within their community. On account of this, the maternal mortality rate has declined significantly in the region. In the agricultural sector there is a special emphasis to improve the status of women headed households.

In the job opportunity creation process, special attention has been given by the urban development sector for women. The bureau of water resources has also been performing a variety of jobs to expand water coverage which helps women to save their energy and time that is spent when collecting water. In addition to these advancements, the regional road authority has been trying to address gender before the implementation of the project with regard to female participation, especially in employment opportunity creation.

When we come to GRB's integration into each sector's annual plan and/or budget, about $75 \%$ of the respondents agree that GRB aspects are sufficiently considered in next year's annual plan and/or budget while $3.6 \%$ disagree with this. In this regard, the assessment team has observed that significant activities have being done to implement gender responsive budgeting in the region.


Fig 27. The view of respondents as to whether the 2015/16 budget plan had considered GRB aspects.

### 1.4 Activities Conducted to Identify Gender Issues in Different Sectors

Empowering half of society's population has an inevitable role to achieve and sustain the development goals of the country. In this regard, we can assess the effort made to identify gender issues in different sectors. In the agricultural sector identifying gender issues are very important to improve agricultural productivity of female farmers. Here, women specific needs have been identified and then these issues are compiled to address them in the planning process. In the education sector special provisions have been given to female teachers during promotion and other activities. Beside this, the causes for female students dropping out have been identified and appropriate measures have been taken to reduce it. There is also an initiative in the justice sector to bring women into leadership positions.

In micro and small enterprise development, there is a target to create permanent jobs for omen. In addition to this, different projects/programs are initiated to look for business areas that make women profitable. This program is supported by different government structures.

In general, identifying gender issues is the basic task in the process of institutionalizing gender responsive budgeting. Thus, the public bodies working in the region have been performing different activities to identify gender issues in their sector.

### 1.5 Good Practices While Implementing GRB Among Different Sectors

Among the other sectors, some good practices while implementing GRB include: a high commitment towards making a plan and budget gender responsive, comprehensive efforts by some sectors to translate the GRB guideline to the local language and to develop their own GRB manuals, implementing projects and programs in a way that benefit women, serious consideration of gender issues among high level officials and conducting short and long term training for women after identifying their needs through assessment.

In addition to these practices, the human resource management process has given priority to women especially during their appointment to leadership positions. Women's struggle for equality through organized methods such as forming associations is cherished by the regional government. In general, the assessment has shown promising results and this should be sustainable throughout the region.

### 1.6 The Concerns that Future GRB Trainings Take into Account

As we know, gender responsive budget trainings have been conducted at different times. In this regard, analyzing the impacts of those trainings has an important role in deciding its future direction. Therefore, some concerns raised by respondents that should be taken into consideration include: training has a very important role in institutionalizing GRB as it is a new concept; conducting training for budget and planning experts should include the participation of high level officials; and facilitating the ground for experience sharing between different regions on GRB implementation would be effective in the implementation of gender responsive budgeting.

## GRB Institutionalization Status in the Region

In addition to the questionnaires focusing on the general situation and issues of GRB, the assessment has employed questionnaires that concern the current status of GRB institutionalization in the region. In this regard, the respondents were asked to give their views on their organization's success level in institutionalizing GRB. Thus, there are three levels (low, medium \& high) showing the GRB institutionalization status. The quantitative results are shown as follows.

With regards to the level of awareness of GRB in their sector, $42.9 \%$ respondents claimed that the level of awareness was low while $28.6 \%$ said that their sector's awareness was medium. And $14.3 \%$ answered that it was at a high level while the remaining $14.3 \%$ said nothing.

About $17.9 \%$ of the respondents believe that the existence of a gender responsive budget statement is low while $57.1 \%$ and $10.7 \%$ believe that it is medium and high respectively. The remaining 14.3 \% did not respond to this question.

For the question about gender responsiveness of the budget process starting from pre-preparation to monitoring and evaluation, $36 \%$ of the respondents believe that this was at a low level. The other 42\% believe that it was at a medium level while $14 \%$ said that it was high. The remaining $8 \%$ did not respond to this question.

Only 7.1\% of the respondents believe that the 2015/16 plan's gender responsiveness was low while 57.1\% and $21.4 \%$ considered it as being medium and high respectively. The remaining $14.3 \%$ did not respond.

For the question that asks for the support level of the gender affairs directorate to institutionalize GRB in their sector, $42.9 \%$ of the respondents considered it as being low while $25 \%$ considered it as being medium. 17.9\% of the respondent consider it as being as high while the remaining $14.2 \%$ did not respond.

With regards to leadership commitment for GRB implementation, $32.1 \%$ of the respondents believe that the level of leadership commitment to institutionalize GRB at different levels was low. On the other hand, $35.7 \%$ and $17.9 \%$ considered the commitment to be medium and high respectively. The remaining $14.3 \%$ did not respond.

In line with the organization's mandate $28.6 \%$ of the respondents consider the budget allocated for the projects and programs that create educational opportunities for women as being low while $53.6 \%$ considered the budget to be at a medium level. The remaining $17.9 \%$ did not respond.

In the service delivery process, $17.9 \%$ of the respondents reflected that in terms of equitable participation and benefits of men and women, this was low while $50 \%$ and $17.9 \%$ believe that it was at a medium and high level respectively. The remaining 14.3 \% did not respond.

For the question that related to the level of budget allocation to ensure women's right and their roles in the decision-making process, $21.4 \%$ of the respondents believed that this was low while $60.7 \%$ and $3.6 \%$ thought that this was at a medium and high level respectively. The remaining $14.3 \%$ did not respond.

About $25 \%$ of the respondents believe that the process of identifying gender issues in their sector is low while $50 \%$ of the respondents believed that the process was at a medium level. The other $7.1 \%$ consider it as being at a high level while the remaining 14.3 \% did not respond.

Finally, for the level of gender consideration in the budget process, $25 \%$ of the respondents believe as low while $39.3 \%$ as medium. The remaining $17.9 \%$ consider as high. The remaining $17.9 \%$ did not responded. Generally, the above qualitative analyses clearly show that most of the sectors are in the level of low and medium regarding institutionalizing GRB. For this matter, focusing on the challenges identified during the assessment and solving them could lead to promising results.

## The Recommendations

Pertaining to institutionalizing GRB in different sectors, few recommendations are drawn based on the assessment results and mainly focus on how to sustain the achievements envisaged so far and addressing challenges encountered. Therefore, the following recommendation may have powerful implications.
> The regional bureau of finance and economic cooperation should provide practical GRB training;

A Arranging experience sharing to learn from best practices;
$>$ The regional bureau of women and children affairs should arrange training mainly to focus on attitudinal changes;
> Creating a partnership with relevant stakeholders to improve leadership awareness on gender.

## Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples Regional State Overview of the Region

SNNPR is one of the nine regions and two administrative councils which were established in 1992/1993. It is bordered by Kenya in the south, Southern Sudan in the south west, Gambela Region in the west and Oromiya Region in the south east. The total area of the Region is 109,015 square kilometer which covers $10 \%$ of the country's total area. For administrative convenience, the Region is structured in 14 zones, 131 woredas, 4 special woredas, 22 urban administrations, 342 urban and 3701 rural kebeles. The Region has desert, lowland, upland, highland and frost climates. According to the results of the 2006/2007 national census, the annual population growth rate is $2.9 \%$ and in $2014 / 2015$ the total population of the Region was $18,970,080$ which covers $20 \%$ of the country's population. The majority of the population is accumulated in the central east and north-east areas of the Region which is on average 161 people per square kilometer. $84.8 \%$ of the population is settled in rural areas and the remaining $15.2 \%$ live in urban areas. Out of the total population of the Region 3.19 \% are under one year of age, $47.9 \%$ below 15 years,
and $50.63 \%$; around half of the population is between $15-64$ years which are active in economic development, while the elderly comprise $2.47 \%$.

At the end of 2014/2015 the average life expectancy of the Region reached 65 years for women and 63 years for men. At present there are 41 hospitals, 703 health centers and 3,835 health posts providing services to the community in the Region. NGOs and private health institutions (7 hospitals, 24 health institutions and more than 500 clinics) are also giving services. Out of the total health professionals there are 10,304 women and around 5,214 men. According to the 2012/2013 Ethiopian Population and Health Study, the benefit of family planning in the Region reached $39 \%$. Termination of pregnancy, pre and post delivery service and HIV Aids test for pregnant mothers has improved the health situation of the region's women.

With regard to education, the Regional Bureau of Education provides information to show that the number of schools and the quality of education has increased and improved from year to year. In 2012/2013 the education data showed that there were 582 kindergartens, 5,683 primary schools and 367 secondary and preparatory schools. 3,842,718 students attend primary schools, out of which $47.2 \%$ are female $(1,813,318)$ while $52.8 \%(2,029,400)$ are male students. 204,349 (57\% male students and 154,691 (43\%) female students attend secondary and preparatory schools .

In 2012/2013 the total regional expenditure was 12.7 billion birr while the total collected revenue was 2.2 billion birr. In general the Region has shown encouraging change in urban development, trade and industry especially micro and small scale development, trade and investment development and the hotel and tourism sector. The agricultural sector has played a significant role for the Region's development, of which coffee contributes to the major share. The sector's 2,550 agricultural training institutions have been established. With regard to infrastructure development, at the end of 2012 /2013, the road network of the region reached $13,705.35 \mathrm{~km}$ and supply of clean water reached $50.72 \%$. In the same year, the number of towns which have electricity services reached 753. With regards to sex disaggregation of civil service employees, out of the 206,425 employees, $70 \%(145,905)$ comprised male and $30 \%(60,520)$ female.

## The Existing Situation of Women in the Region

Like other developing countries, due to backward thinking prevalent within the society, women do not participate and benefit from different activities. However, recently with the massive support of the government at the national level, many initiatives have been implemented in which women participate and benefit. Likewise, in the southern region due to a recessive attitude, the role of women was not transparently acknowledged. To reverse this situation and ensure equitable gender benefits, the Regional Government is making progress in various sectors.

By strengthening the capacity of micro and small-scale sectors to create strong economic power, in the year 2014/2015 out of the 651,918 Omo Micro Finance loan service beneficiaries, $21 \%(136,902)$ were women.

In the education sector, to strengthen the participation of women in education, in 2012/2013 out of the $4,201,758$ primary and secondary students the participation of female students reached $46.8 \%$ $(1,968,009)$. This shows that the effort to increase participation of female students has shown progress.

In the health sector, in addition to benefiting women in the health extension program, post-natal service coverage is $51 \%$ and the coverage of family planning reached $55.7 \%$.

The regional government has a wide-range of ongoing activities in addressing gender based on concrete changes and centering gender balance. However, from the proportion of women in the regional population viewpoint, strong endeavors are required to ensure female participation and benefit as well as to create an integrated work system.

## General Information on the Respondents

From the selected 10 Offices for this assessment study, 30 professionals participated. The participants are from the Bureau of Agriculture and Natural Resources (5), Bureau of Health (5), Bureau of Education (2), Water and Irrigation Bureau (2), Bureau of Labor and social Affairs (2), Transport Authority (2), Road Authority (3), Bureau of Urban Development (4), Bureau of Justice (3) and Omo Micro Finance Institution (2).

## Table 5



## Enabling an environment to Institutionalize the Gender Responsive System and Training on Gender Responsive Budgeting in the Region

There are enabling environments to institutionalize gender perspectives in the regional sector offices which among others include the existence of an independent gender office in the institutions. From the selected 10 sample institutions for this assessment study, 9 (99\%) have Mainstreamed gender. This office participates in the annual plan preparation as well as in the monitoring and evaluation system of those institutions. The other enabling environment to institutionalize gender is orientation training on how to mainstream gender in planning and the achievements of behavioral change. One of the objectives of establishing a gender office is to include gender in planning and budgeting as well as to work together in collaboration with concerned bodies and to deliver timely training. In relation to this, the Regional Bureau of Agriculture and Natural Resources and the Bureau of Justice could be taken as model institutions in preparing pamphlets for awareness creation. In addition, the existence of working sections which mainstream gender perspectives helps to institutionalize the issue. For example, the activities of
the Awareness Creation Work Process of the Bureau of Justice create positive attitudes towards gender. In this Bureau, the activities of the Accusation and Investigation for Women and Children Work Process in collaboration with UN WOMEN ensure direct benefit of women and enable the foundation to institutionalize gender.

The commitment and transparency of the regional policies and strategies towards gender equality can be taken as a legal framework and it enable the environment to mainstream gender in all activities. In addition the existence of different organizations like the women's league, the women's federation and association are good opportunities to institutionalize gender and to work with them. In addition to this, the Development Team operates at a national level and in its activities of transforming women from the backward way of life, ensures equal participation and benefit of women with men as it disseminates the gender perspective in the society.

Enabling environments to institutionalize gender include: mainstreaming of gender in the annual plan of the institutions transparently, giving a separate budget code for Mainstreaming of Gender in Development Work Process, integration with stakeholders and existence of a gender office in some bureaus up to the woreda level.

In general, the preparation of a gender responsive guideline by sector offices at the institution level has a great contribution to mainstream gender perspectives in planning and budgeting. From the 10 sector offices in which this study has been conducted, three offices have prepared the guideline at the bureau level. These include: the Regional Bureau of Agriculture and Natural Resources, the Bureau of Justice and the Bureau of Urban Development and Housing. This shows that $30 \%$ have prepared the guideline while 70\% did not prepare it.


Fig 28 Training participation on Gender Responsive Budgeting

The Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation has carried out gender related capacity building training at different times. Out of the 30 respondents of this assessment, around 20 ( 12 male, 8 female) have participated in these trainings while 8 ( 6 male, 2 female) did not participate and the remaining 2 gave no response. The respondents of the Regional Bureau of Health and Bureau of Agriculture and Natural Resources comprise the highest number of trainees whereas the Omo Micro Finance holds the lowest. In addition, out of the respondents 6 were from Gender and 22 were from the Development Plan Preparation, Monitoring and Evaluation /DPPME/ Work Process. From the six gender professionals four (66.6\%) have taken the training while two did not participate in the training. Similarly, around 16 professionals from the DPPME Work Process have taken the training, while the remaining six did not get the training.

From the respondents who took training on Gender Responsive Budgeting, twelve professionals (60\%) received adequate knowledge, while the remaining eight (40\%) could not get adequate skills from the training. Out of these respondents ten (83\%) have incorporated this into their work, while two (17\%) did not incorporate the skill they acquired into practice. The main reasons for this includes a shortage of budget, the division of labor in the DPPME Work Process, being a new employee and some attributed this to unrelated training with their job, while the remaining two did not respond. What we understand from this is that due to different reasons all the training could not be incorporated into practice. Therefore, a solution is required having identified these challenges.

## Problems Encountered in Implementing Gender Responsive Budgeting.

Sector professionals have been trained in skills to institutionalize gender perspectives. Despite the enabling environments aforementioned to institutionalize gender, there are also many challenges preventing such institutionalization. The first problem is attitude, which can be seen from the assumption of women (held themselves) as being minorities in society, and the other is the assumption of men that gender issues belong to women only. The second problem is related to a lack of awareness and a skill gap of the professionals as well as the gender experts. The other issue indicated as a problem is that gender related projects did not benefit women.

The Regional Micro Finance as an example, tried to change the life of women who are in bad working condition by providing loans. However, it's not possible to find the targeted women as they did not disclose their work. In some offices due to the low-level position of Mainstreaming Gender in the Development Work Process at the woreda level, the interest of the implementers largely declined. In addition, we found that a lack of enough professionals who work in the Bureaus of Mainstreaming Gender in Development created an increased work load.

As shown in figure 2 below, out of the total respondents nine (50\%) indicated a lack of an appropriate working system as a problem, while four ( $22.2 \%$ ) mentioned attitudinal problems around gender, three (16.7\%) indicated a capacity constraint and two (11.1\%) pointed out a lack of understanding and traditional practices as a challenge. The remaining twelve participants gave no response.

To resolve these challenges the Regional Bureaus followed different directions for a solution. For example, the Regional Water and Irrigation Bureau provided short and long-term training for women in its coordinated activities with health institutions, education and finance and it also facilitated loans with the Omo Micro Finance. In order to close the attitudinal gap, sector offices provided capacity building trainings and also financial assistance for those who take the COC examination.


Fig 29 Problems encountered in implementing gender responsive budgeting

## Implementation Strategies as well as Monitoring and Evaluation to Institutionalize Gender

To institutionalize gender, the strategies used by the majority of sector institutions include that capacity building of professionals and leadership, to give attention for gender in the annual plan, to facilitate educational opportunities for women workers and capacity building of women during employment. Apart from these, the Omo Micro Finance Institution is one of the institutions who use integrated strategies to ensure equitable benefits of women. In addition to including gender in educational documents, it creates a forum to coordinate the higher officials in the Bureau of Women, Children and Youth Affairs and the concerned bodies. The objective is to make women who are at the lower level of informal jobs and various revenue generating activities to benefit from saving by preparing a saving implementation strategy. For the Omo Micro Finance Institution, the main strategy to institutionalize gender is to show the number of women in its plan of loan services, in a transparent manner. For example, the 2015/16 plan target shows that from 934,885 loan customers $34 \%(317,860)$ to be women.

The Regional Bureau of Justice also makes gender perspectives part of their work process using 8 units. The Bureau of Urban development also creates job opportunities, half of the beneficiaries must be women and under its 15 organizations gender receives its proper place and special attention is given to women and children in the food security program.

The Development Plan Preparation, Monitoring and Evaluation Work Process of the regional sector institutions monitors and evaluates the process from preparation up to implementation, alongside its strategic and annual plan. This monitoring and evaluation system exists in all sector institutions yet it is not uniform. It follows the implementation of planned targets and by preparing a check list it evaluates the performance and gives feedback. In relation to this, Mainstreaming of Gender in the Development Work Process should prepare its own checklist and strengthen its monitoring and evaluation system. The Omo Micro Finance is one of the bureaus which has organized a strong monitoring and evaluation system. It prepares a check list including gender and monitors its work twice a year. In addition, performance of the plan is evaluated at the head office level and feedback is given on activities that need improvement. The Bureau of Urban Development and the Bureau of Transport are exemplary institutions with regard to monitoring and evaluation. In addition, the Bureau of Urban Development and Housing and the Gender Mainstreaming Office participate and give points in the evaluation of their quarterly plan implementation. It also sends feedback to reform towns after the quarterly field program is conducted. The monitoring evaluation of the Bureau of Education, the Bureau of Health and the Bureau of Agriculture and Natural Resources should be strengthened by centering gender.

In general, gender responsive budgeting can be achieved if a strong monitoring and evaluation system is put in place. The efforts of sectors to mainstream gender in planning could be a good experience for other regions.

For the question, 'was gender mainstreamed in your sector's previous year performance review?' the majority of the respondents ( $92.8 \%$ ) have stated that gender has been mainstreamed while around $7.2 \%$ have expressed that gender was not mainstreamed when last year's performance was evaluated. On the other hand, to check the inclusion of gender in the performance report of the work processes of the institutions, $89.2 \%$ (25) of participants have expressed that it is included while $10.8 \%(3)$ indicated that it is not included in the report. In general, the performance report of the plan shows that there has been progress in the inclusion of gender perspectives. In addition, for the query as to whether the institutions identified gender issues or not, 21 (75\%) replied that it is identified while around 3 (10.7\%) responded that it is not identified. The remaining 6 (14.3\%) do not have any cognizance as to whether it is identified or not.

## Efforts made by Regional Sectors to Mainstream Gender Perspectives in the 2015/16 Budget Preparation Process

The assessment tried to see the efforts made to mainstream gender perspectives in the 2015/16 fiscal year plan and budget preparation of sectors after the training of trainers on gender responsive budgeting and some sectors have shown good progress. When we see the plan of the Omo Micro Finance Institution, from the loan service of the 2015/16 fiscal year, $34 \%$ of the beneficiaries will be women. This helps to ensure the participation and benefit of women against the targets in the monitoring and evaluation process. The regional Bureau of Urban Development and Housing has transparently indicated that in terms of job creation 50\% of the beneficiaries will be women. Similarly, the Regional Bureau of Health also mainstreamed gender in its strategic plan of 2015 to 2019. The strategic plan aims to reduce maternal and child mortality i.e. child mortality to reach $9.8 \%$ and maternal mortality 199 per 100,000 live births with delivery by trained professionals. The Regional Bureau of Education has included in its annual plan aims to balance the number of female and male students at all educational levels. The Bureau of Justice has included in its plan aims to prepare a gender mainstreaming guideline at the institutional level. Similarly, some sectors work with capacity building to make women benefit in short and long-term trainings. To conclude, in the fiscal year 2015/2016 there is an encouraging start in some sectors. However, we need to work hard in order to create similar situations in other sectors.


Fig 30 Efforts made by Regional Sectors to Mainstream Gender Perspectives in the 2015/16 Budget Preparation Process

As we understand from the above figure, out of the regional sector offices in which this assessment study was conducted, around $78.5 \%$ (22) of respondents stated that gender had been properly mainstreamed in the budget in their institution's 2015/16 annual plan, while about $10.7 \%$ (3) replied that it was not mainstreamed, $10.7 \%$ (3) have no idea whether it is mainstreamed or not and the remaining 2 participants gave no response.

To explore how gender perspectives will be carried out in the 2015/2016 budget allocation of the institution, 25 participants gave a response while 5 did not reply. Accordingly, from the 25 respondents about 10 (40\%) expressed that the budget allocation mainstreamed gender based on the needs of both women and men by making a gender analysis. The educational and training budget is allotted by assessing (in advance) the training needs of female workers in order to mainstream gender issues. $24 \%$ (6) of the respondents also indicated that gender perspectives are considered in the budget allocation of poverty targeted sectors for equitable benefit of women with men. These sectors include food security, supply of clean water, education and health. Moreover, $16 \%$ (4) have expressed that their institution works in order to consider gender issues in the budget allocation by empowering women, having legal protection and upgrading their understanding, giving training and working to ensure equal opportunity in job creation. In general, all have recently recognized that gender should be seen in the regional budget allocation process of sector institutions and the current experiences are encouraging.

## Accomplishments to Empower Women Workers in the Institutions



Fig 31 Accomplishments to Empower Women Workers in the Institutions

The activities of regional institutions to empower women workers such as: providing managerial training, organizing a mutual learning forum, providing training to improve their skills, and facilitating educational opportunities are good starts and should be strengthened and sustained.

To examine the strategic plan of the institutions as to whether it contained special professional training to empower their women workers, around 13 (48.1\%) respondents expressed that it is incorporated into the plan, while $33.3 \%$ (9) indicated that it is not included in the plan. However, the remaining 5 (18.1\%) have no information on the issue. The above activities are included in the plan of the majority sector offices.

## Strength and Good Experiences around Gender Responsive Budgeting in the Sectors of the Region.

There are good experiences in the regional sectors in relation to institutionalizing gender responsive budgeting which include preparing a proposal and soliciting funding for capacity building of professionals as well as mainstreaming gender perspectives in the budget process transparently. As we understand from the above information, the Regional Bureau of Agriculture and Natural Resources solicit funding in collaboration with partners by considering the challenges. The Bureau of Water and Irrigation Development also allocates a budget to improve the educational status of women workers. The Bureau of Justice has prepared a gender mainstreaming guideline and other sector offices have assigned a professional who is responsible for gender perspectives. This shows that if an initiation exists, there is no challenge which hinders the operating of a gender responsive budget.

In general, if a strong monitoring and evaluation procedure is set up, we can understand that these activities could be good experiences for other regions in implementing gender responsive budgeting. As we understand from the figure below, to assess the extent of incorporating indicators in their monitoring and evaluation document, twenty (74.1\%) expressed that gender indicators are included while 18.5\% or around 5 indicated that said indicators are not included in their monitoring and evaluation documents due to skill constraints, the internal working system, and attitudinal problems. Out of the indicated reasons, the main problem in not incorporating gender indicators in the action plan is a limitation of attitude. This goes from the meaning of gender indicators to its necessity. Out of the respondents, 7.4\% (2) do not have any awareness about the inclusion of indicators. In general, a check list has been prepared of planned targets and activities. As shown in the quantitative analysis, gender issues are identified by
indicators in the monitoring and evaluation document of many sector institutions which should be sustained and encouraged.

Fig 32 Gender indicators in the action plan as well as in the monitoring and evaluation


## Future Directions of Capacity Building Training on Gender Responsive Budgeting

Comments were given by stakeholders to help them design practical capacity building training on gender responsive budgeting. In connection to the capacity building training, the respondents indicated that the training of trainers should be sustained and strengthened. The training should also be successive and inter-related. In addition to the success of training in bringing about required change, primarily skill and awareness creation is required for the leadership at all levels in order to generate ownership. It is also indicated that training opportunities should be organized for the leadership up to the woreda level. The training on gender perspective should also be organized by bringing together both the leadership and professionals in order to interchange their views. Other related sector trainings should be gender inclusive as to make professionals aware about gender concepts. In addition to this, it is possible to minimize current problems by organizing similar trainings for the society and the public enterprise. Moreover, in relation to the method of training, display methods should be considered in order to make the training practical.

## Points Raised by Regional Sectors Who Do Not Show Gender Perspectives Transparently in their 2015/2016 Budget Process

Some regional bureaus have tried to mainstream gender issues in the 2015/2016 fiscal year. However, as indicated by respondents during the assessment study, gender related information gaps in sector offices create problems to mainstream gender in their tasks transparently. For example, for queries like, 'how many women workers are there up to woreda level?' 'What is their educational level?' And other similar questions, there is no organized and up-to-date information. The participants of the assessment study mentioned that as planning is based on baseline data, a shortage of information around gender inhibits its inclusion in planning. The main reasons for the information gap include a lack of a strong organizational structure in relation to gender, and considering gender as an additional task which leads to a lack of ownership. The diverse structure in sector offices create a big challenge not to mainstream gender issues in the plan and budget process in each sector.

## Quantitative Viewpoint of the Institutionalization of Gender Perspectives in Sector Offices

During the assessment study, in addition to the written and oral questions asked to assess the situation around gender responsive budgeting in sector offices, professionals were requested to indicate the existing situation of their institution in institutionalizing gender perspectives. Accordingly, they responded with low, medium and high levels and the result is shown as follows.


Fig 33. Quantitative Viewpoint of the Institutionalization of Gender Perspectives in Sector Offices

As shown in the quantitative information in the assessment study, when participants ranked the awareness level with respect to gender responsive budgeting in their institution (question no. 1), 21.7\% of participants placed the awareness at a low level, $69.6 \%$ placed it as medium, and $8.7 \%$ ranked its presence as a high level.

When they rank the gender responsiveness of the plan and budget submission (question no. 2), 16.7\% ranked it as low, $70.8 \%$ ranked it as medium and $12.5 \%$ gave it a high level for gender responsiveness of the plan and budget submission.

Similarly, in ranking the gender responsiveness of the budget process from the budget call up to the monitoring and evaluation (question no. 3), 29.2\% ranked it as low, the majority (58.7\%) ranked it as medium, and $12.5 \%$ ranked it as being at high levels.

It is mentioned that the majority of the regional sector offices have mainstreamed gender in their 2015/2016 annual plan. Therefore, to see the gender responsiveness of the annual plan (question no.4), $20.8 \%, 54.2 \%$ and $25 \%$ ranked the responsiveness as low, medium and high respectively.

In addition, they have ranked the integration between their institution and the Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation with respect to the implementation of gender responsive budgeting (Question no. 5). Accordingly, the majority $65.2 \%$ indicated the relation as being at a low level, $17.4 \%$ and $17.4 \%$ indicated the level as being medium and high respectively.

In relation to the support given to the mainstreaming of gender in the Development Work Process in order to implement gender responsive budgeting in their institution (Question no. 6), 9.1\%, 68.2\% and 22.7\% put low, medium and high levels respectively.

In addition, in relation to commitment of the leadership at different levels in the implementation of gender responsive budgeting (question no. 7), $26.1 \%$ ranked the commitment as low, $52.2 \%$ ranked it as medium, and $21.7 \%$ ranked it as being at a high level.

In terms of the allocation of budget for gender specific programs in their institution (Question no.8), 39.1\% of respondents ranked this as low, $39.1 \%$ ranked this as medium and $31.7 \%$ ranked this as high.

In addition, with respect to the equitable benefit of women and men in the allocated budget, the implemented activities and the services delivered by their institution (Question no.9), 8.7\% ranked this as low, $60.9 \%$ ranked this as medium and $30.4 \%$ ranked this as being at a high level.

In regard to the capacity of the budget allocation to ensure women's rights and strengthening their role (Question no. 10), $26.1 \%$ ranked this capacity as being low, $52.2 \%$ ranked this as being at a medium level, and $21.7 \%$ ranked this as being at a high level.

In relation to identifying gender issues in their institution (Question no. 11), 20.8\% indicated that the identification is low, $62.5 \%$ expressed that it is medium while $16.7 \%$ indicated that issues are identified properly.

Finally, to rank how far gender issues are mainstreamed in the budgeting and planning process (Question no12), 13\%, $60.9 \%$ and $26.1 \%$ ranked the gender mainstreaming as being low, medium and high respectively.

In general, as we understand from the above quantitative information, the implementation of gender responsive budgeting is at a medium level in the majority of sector offices. It would be possible to institutionalize gender if the activities which were ranked at a low level improved.

## The Way Forward and Future Directions.

Based on the assessment study the following solutions have been pointed out to give a response for the query, 'what should be done in the future to strengthen the efforts so far made to institutionalize gender responsive budgeting in the region and eliminate challenges once and for all?
$>$ The Bureau of Finance and Economic Development and the Bureau of Women, Children and Youth should play a leading role to establish integration among the regional sectors in order to form a strong gender responsive budgeting task force which brings about accountability and responsibility around gender responsive budgeting.
> The efforts started by some institutions to organize training on gender responsive budgeting for the leadership up to the lower level of administration should be expanded to other institutions. Mainstreaming of gender perspectives should be mandatory in the region and administrative measures should be taken by those who work without mainstreaming gender.
$>$ An organized data on gender perspectives is a big gap at a national level; it is also the same at a regional level. Therefore, all sectors should use their role to resolve this issue.
> To eliminate the gender gap from its origin, one should organize an orientation and awareness creation forum. This could encompass the society and include this in the higher education curriculum under the topic 'how to mainstream gender perspectives in development and planning.'
$>$ To take administrative measures on the institutions who do not mainstream gender perspectives in the planning and budgeting process as well as in projects.

It is possible to include gender perspectives in the work process of institutions if Mainstreaming of Gender in the Development Work Process gives points to other work processes in the annual monitoring and evaluation process.

## The Addis Ababa City Administration

## Overview of the Administration

Addis Ababa is located at 9오́ 48" Latitude North and 38o $4^{\prime} 24^{\prime \prime \prime}$ Longitude East. Addis Ababa is the capital city of the country and is located at 2100 meters above sea level with a total area of 540 Square kilometers. The city is divided into ten sub cities that are comprised of 116 Woredas. According to the survey the national Statistics Agency published in 2015, the population of Addis Ababa is $3,048,631$ of which $1,595,663$ are male while $1,452,63$ are female residents.

## General Profile of Respondents

Fig 34: Respondents in terms of sex composition


As the above graph (1) shows, the total number of experts that filled out the questionnaires is 21 of which $48 \%$ were female and $52 \%$ are male.

Respondents in terms of educational status


Graph 2 demonstrated the proportion of gender, planning and budgeting experts that participated in the assessment with regards to their educational qualification disaggregated by sex. Accordingly, from the total male respondents $40 \%$ are first degree holders while the remaining $60 \%$ are second degree holders. On the other hand, $50 \%$ of women hold first degrees whereas second degree holders also constitute $50 \%$.

## Institutionalizing a Gender Responsive Procedure in City Administration Level

Conducive situations should be availed in order to institutionalize gender perspective in a sustainable manner. Though it has been a short time since the country signed different conventions which are incorporated into the country's policy and legal framework, there has been good practices and results in breaking through the old attitude towards gender issues.

Some of the encouraging initiatives taken are the incorporation of gender issues in plans of various levels, publications of various awareness creation documents, introduction of various structures, implementing affirmative actions for women when there is a vacancy and some offices give due attention for gender issues. The establishment of 10 female forums in the 6 hospitals under the 10 sub cities can be cited as an
example. The forums undertake surveys on the need of training for women, membership of the forum as well as what kind of tasks they should perform. In general, according to the assessments conducted in several bureaus of the administration, the offices should clearly lay down gender issues with due attention and focus.

The offices that were the subject of this assessment were noted to have used gender awareness creation flyers in order to institutionalize the issues of gender as well as coordinating efforts with the various stakeholders. With regards to this the bureau of health is working in collaboration with UNWOMEN.

The assessment has shown that there have been good practices in offices in respect to incorporating a gender responsive budget. In addition, there have been activities planned in terms of a designated budget which has been allotted for gender related issues with a detail plan. There was also a sufficient budget assigned to implement the plan. It was also considered as an encouraging step in appointing female department heads. The Head of the Addis Ababa Roads Authority stressed that a common goal has been set concerning a Score Card which has facilitated the conducive situations for women.

Fig 36: Gender Responsive Budgeting Capacity Building Trainings


With regard to training on gender responsive budgeting, $14.3 \%$ of respondents have been trained while the remaining $85.8 \%$ responded that they have never participated in such a kind of training. On the other hand, from those respondents who have been taking part in training, $4.8 \%$ of the respondents believe they have gained sufficient knowledge and skills while $28.6 \%$ responded that they have not gained sufficient knowledge and the other $66.7 \%$ of the respondents said nothing. In addition, the respondents
whose responses were "Yes", have been asked whether they have practiced the knowledge acquired from the training; 19\% believe that they did not put it into practice while $81.0 \%$ did not respond to the question at all.

Respondents who said "No" were asked why their response was "No" and they justified their answer by explaining that the structure is narrow and that the task is too big for a small number of people to undertake. Furthermore, the respondents explained that attitudinal bias towards gender is a problem as well as a low commitment of department heads and a lack of budget. In addition, the respondents stated that limited access for training and a lack of support and monitoring hindered the effective implementation of GRB.

## Problems encountered while implementing Gender Responsive Budgeting

There are problems that were faced time and again during the effort in institutionalizing gender issues. The major problem in this regard is the skill gap created in the executive organs and entitled in the respective level. Despite the various trainings delivered, there has not been that much of a fruitful result. There is also a tendency to regard gender issues as only a problem for women as well as the misconception of making the inclusion of gender issues in budgeting. Some bureaus have not clearly included gender aspects in their budget. They have also noted that there is a refusal from employees of the finance department to release the budget.

Fig 37: Problems encountered in implementing the acquired knowledge into practice


Experts that took part in the assessment expressed the problems that they have encountered in putting the skills they have acquired from the training. About $9.5 \%$ said they faced a problem with attitude, a limitation in skill and inconvenient procedures while $71.4 \%$ failed to respond (Please refer to graph 4).

## Inclusion in the plan and budget of sectors in 2016

The assessment has indicated that there are encouraging initiatives with respect to their inclusion in the plan and budgets of sectors in 2016 and some sectors have begun to witness encouraging efforts.

The city administration's small and micro enterprises bureau has been assessed as to whether gender is comprehensively incorporated and holds a benefit to women from the planning stage to the implementation stage and from the bureau up to the woreda level. Focal persons have been re-organized in every sub-city to oversee the implementation.

In addition, based on the baseline document of the 2015/16 fiscal year, consideration has been made to include gender issues in administrative plans at every level and to organize gender disaggregated data. Furthermore, their plan has been shown to incorporate the empowerment of women, ensuring that they benefit from loan provision, technology supply, market chain, manufacturing and selling facilities, input supply and other assistance.

Fig 38: Status of the incorporation of gender issues according to the performance evaluation of the offices the respondents serve in


As demonstrated in graph 5, for the question as to whether gender issues were included when the performance of last year was evaluated, $71.4 \%$ responded "Yes" while $19 \%$ responded "No" and the remaining $9.6 \%$ did not respond at all. Similarly, for the question as to whether gender issues were included in the performance reports, $81 \%$ responded "Yes" while $14.3 \%$ said "No" and the remaining 4.7\% did not respond to the question.

Fig 39- Whether gender issues have been identified and included in the institution and whether gender issues have been sufficiently included in the institution's /sector's 2015/16 plan program budget.


As indicated in graph 6, for the question as to whether gender issues have been identified in the institution, out of the respondent experts, $71.5 \%$ responded "Yes" while 9.5\% responded "No" and 19\% responded that "They don't know". Similarly, for the question as to whether gender issues have been included sufficiently in the 2015/16 plan/program budget, $51.1 \%$ responded "Yes" while $14.3 \%$ responded "No" and the remaining $28.6 \%$ responded "I don't Know"


For the question as to how the institution has included gender issues in the institution's 2015/16 program budget, $16.7 \%$ of respondents agreed that a budget designated for gender is considered in the program budget while $58.3 \%$ stated that the budget is allocated based on the need of men and women and is supported with gender analysis. The remaining $25.0 \%$ responded that gender issues have been duly considered in a poverty focused budget allocation (Refer Graph 7).

Similarly, the Addis Ababa roads authority has planned to give emphasis for women with respect to training and education opportunities. Out of the allotted budget $1 \%$ has been allocated for activities related with HIV and women.

## Graph 8-Clear indication of gender issues in the sector's program for the 2015/2016 budget year.



As indicted in graph 8 above, for the question as to whether gender issues are clearly indicated in the 2015/16 budget, about $50 \%$ responded "Yes" that it had been indicated in the implementation process whereas $25 \%$ responded that it had been demonstrated in the program, while $8 \%$ stated that it was shown in target and indicators.

Graph 9: inclusion of delivery of special training to female employees in the institution's strategic plan.

# Inclusion of delivery of special training o women emloyee in the institiution's strategic plane 



As indicated in graph 9 most of the gender and budget planning experts which is about $33 \%$ responded "Yes" that their institution includes the delivery of special training to female employees in their strategic plan while $14 \%$ stated that it is not included in the strategic plan. The majority ( $53 \%$ ) responded that "They don't know".

On the other hand, the experts asserted that there are numerous activities underway aiming to assist female employees in addition to trainings offered. For example, the social and labor affairs bureau have taken steps to improve education levels of female employees whereas the Addis Ababa water and sewerage authority, as of recent, have given due attention to women and young people to come into leadership positions by providing the necessary support.

In addition, the Addis Ababa health bureau has taken steps to establish a women's forum in the bureau and in health institutions to empower and capacitate women in order to bring them into leadership responsibilities. Furthermore, it was indicated that the existence of various administrative procedures have given an opportunity for women to join the management. For example, the organization of women in 1 to 5 schemes have been noted. The education bureau stated that it is making progress in this issue by assigning women as work coordinators and it has started delivery of trainings in schools to promote teachers to the management level.

In relation to this, the head of the Addis Ababa Road Authority's budget and planning department explained that the problem of empowering women has been considered as an indicator and that an assessment is made on the outcome of an evaluation made every 6 months.

## Graph 10: Are gender issue indicators included in schedule, monitoring and evaluation documents.

## 1 Inclusion of indicator in schedule,monotoring and evaluation document 2 If your answer is No specific the reason



As indicated above, for the question as to whether gender aspects are included as indicators, 47.6\% responded "Yes" while $23.8 \%$ responded "No" and $28.6 \%$ did not respond to the question. For the question asking respondents to elaborate if their answers were "No", most of the experts (81\%) did not respond while $9.5 \%$ stated that the reason for not including the indicators are limitations in skills \& a problem of attitude (Refer graph).

The bureaus have been trying to put in place the monitoring and evaluation system to follow up the performance of planned activities. Though the beginning looks promising there still remains a long way to include gender issues as one of the indicators. On the other hand the 2014/2015 performance report of Addis Ababa small and micro enterprises shows that monitoring and supporting activities has been undertaken to ensure the plan for the budget year is being implemented as planned and that the bureau has given written feedback based on the findings obtained from the evaluation report and supervision.

Furthermore, it was noted that support has been provided starting from the sub city level and the command post from the woreda up to the sub city level has introduced and implemented transparent monitoring and support systems with the view of resolving problems. Experts have been assigned to the bureaus in all of the 10 sub cities and the woredas under them in order to ensure monitoring and supporting activities are continuous and are solving problems.

## Quantitative observation of Gender Responsive

## Budget being institutionalized

Based on questionnaires that focused on the general status of gender responsive budgeting in the city administration, respondents from different sectors were asked to rank the level of gender responsive budgeting's institutionalization categorizing it as low, average and high. Accordingly, the quantitative data collected has been analysed.


As demonstrated in graph 10, for the question as to how gender, planning and budgeting experts rank the institutionalization of gender responsive budgeting in their sector, $52.9 \%$ ranked the status as "Low" while 47.1\% ranked it as average.

The city administration's small and micro enterprises bureau has been assessed as to whether gender aspects are comprehensively incorporated and also whether fair benefits to women have been ensured, across all stages and across all levels. Focal persons have been re-organized in every sub-city to oversee the implementation.

In addition, based on the baseline document of the 2015/16 fiscal year consideration has been made to include gender issues in the plans of administrative structures across all level as well as to organize gender disaggregated data. Furthermore, their plan has been shown to have incorporated the empowerment of women to ensure their benefit following the developmental outcome. As a result, the bureaus are striving to benefit women through facilitating loan provisions, technology supply, market chain, manufacturing and selling facilities, input supply and other assistances.

Question no. 2: for the question, as to how much of the allocated budget considers gender aspects, 41.2\% responded 'Low', 41.2\% responded 'Average', while 17.6\% of the experts responded 'High'.

Question no. 3: for the question, as to how much the process of proposing a budget up to the evaluation stage considers gender issues, $58.8 \%$ responded 'Low', $35.3 \%$ responded 'Average', while $5.9 \%$ of the experts responded 'High'.

Question no. 4: for the question, as to how much the plan for 2015/16 was responsive to gender issues, 58.8\% responded 'Low', 35.3\% responded 'Average', While 5.9\% of the experts responded 'High'.

Question no. 5: for the question, as to how much coordination there was between the sector office and the ministry of finance and economic development regarding gender, 37.5\% responded 'Low' 50\% responded 'Average', while 12.5\% of the experts responded 'High'.

Question no. 6: for the question, as to the implementation of a gender responsive budget by a gender department in the office, $43.8 \%$ responded that the level was 'Low' and $56.2 \%$ responded that the level was 'Average',

Question no. 7: for the question, as to the level of commitment of the management in the implementation of a gender responsive budget, $25 \%$ responded 'Low' 62.5\% responded 'Average', while the rest responded with 'High'.

Question no. 8: for the question as to the sufficiency of the budget allotted for activities concerning women, $37.5 \%$ responded 'Low', $56.2 \%$ responded 'Average', while $6.3 \%$ of the experts responded with 'High'.

Question no. 9: for the question, as to the fairness of the benefit gained by women and men, 37.5\% responded 'Low', 56.2\% responded 'Average', while $6.3 \%$ of the experts responded with'High'.

Question no. 10: for the question, as to how much the budget is utilized to ensure the role of women, $25 \%$ responded 'Low', $4.7 \%$ responded 'Average', while $31.3 \%$ of the experts responded 'High'.

Question no. 11: for the question, as to the level of identification of gender issues in their sector, 43.8\% responded 'Low', 37.4\% responded 'Average', while 18.8\% of the experts responded 'High'

Question no. 12: for the question, as to the level of inclusion of gender issues in the budget and planning of the department, $25 \%$ responded 'Low', $68.7 \%$ responded 'Average', while $6.3 \%$ of the experts responded 'High'.

## Recommended Solutions in Institutionalizing Gender issues

- The delivery of capacity building should be fully implemented to institutionalize gender responsive budgeting.
- Monitoring and supportive activities should be in place in order to give due attention to gender issues


## Oromia Regional State

## Overview of the Region

The Oromia region is one of the nine regional states in Ethiopia. In terms of population size and land coverage, it is the largest region in the country. According to the Central Statistics Authority's 2015/16 report, the region covers 254,538 square kilometer which is organized in to 18 zonal, 265 woredas and 6255 rural kebeles. The population size was $29,624,614$ which is about $36.7 \%$ of the national population size. In sex ratio, 14,918,538 (50.3\%) are male while the remaining 14,706,076 (49.7\%) are female. From the total regional population $87 \%$ of the population lives in rural areas and this constitutes $41.3 \%$ of the national population that live in rural areas. Moreover, $80 \%$ of the source of income comes from the agricultural sector.

This assessment covered 11 sector bureaus while the data collection methods included questionnaires and interviews with key informants. From the 44 questionnaires about 38 ( $86.4 \%$ ) responded and the detail analysis is presented as follows.

## Major Finding of the Assessment

The following graphs present a brief profile of the respondents in educational background and sex.


From the questionnaires distributed to the bureau of education it was seen that half of the respondents believed that support of women within the sector especially in empowering and promoting women into leadership position is low while the other half believed that there were no obstacles that hinder women from coming into leadership positions (except lack of motivation among the women and low educational status). Incidentally, the second growth and transformation plan for the sector is a target to reach at least 25\% women engagement in school leadership positions.

One of the best practices from this sector is the fact that there is budget allocation based on the needs of both men and women as well as a follow up on whether this budget had been effectively used or not. After identifying gender issues in the sector some interventions had been designed to bring women teachers into leadership positions, reducing sexual harassment on female students, conducting training for executives, and filling technological gaps among women. Other than this there hadn't been any effort to make gender analysis before allocating budget.

The government's agricultural and rural development policy and strategy has been successful with regard to benefiting women and men fairly which contributes to ensure fast and sustainable economic growth in the country. This has been realized for the last six years in terms of championing female farmers and semipastoralists are prized for their outstanding results. From the regional bureau of agricultural $83 \%$ of the questionnaires are filled and the results are described as follows.

About 65\% of respondents reflect that their respective sector isn't practicing gender responsive budgeting due to a lack of practical capacity building training on gender responsive budgeting while $35 \%$ of the respondents believe that it is due to a lack of commitment.

With regard to mainstreaming gender issues into the planning and budgeting process, $55 \%$ of the respondents revealed that the program budget is not yet implemented while $25 \%$ responded that gender issues are incorporated in the allocating budget for pro-poor sector. The remaining $20 \%$ revealed that they were unaware of the issue.

Concerning the identification of gender issues for the purpose of integrating gender into the annual plan, most of the respondents believe that there should be an accountable structural base for the practice. Nonetheless, there is a small amount of budget allocated to departments for gender related trainings. One can therefore infer that creating a gender affairs structure is a critical step to implement GRB. Otherwise identifying gender issues will be a difficult task without having a guiding entity.

The majority of the respondents ( $90 \%$ ) believe that there is no effort to empower women especially to promote them into decision making positions. However, gender and development related trainings have been provided for women. Since ensuring women participation and benefit is one of the government's priority areas, each department has been trying their best to mainstream this into their plan. In this case the second growth and transformation plan has incorporated gender issues.

From the health bureau there was a $60 \%$ respondent rate. Most of the respondents consider that the effort that had been made to identify gender issues is satisfactory. This is because one of the priority areas in the sector is reducing maternal and child mortality and so engaging community members, especially women, has an important role. In this regard, women have been enabled to participate from the grass root level. However, the respondents believe that gender responsive budget is not practiced fully because the program budget is not yet implemented in the region.

In terms of supporting female staff especially bringing them into decision making positions there is no intrinsically noticeable achievement. Though the sector is mainly characterized by having numerous female staff including health extension workers, the engagement in decision making positions are minimal. In this regard, the gender affairs department of the sector has been performing a lot of the efforts especially capacity building activities. Here, there is plan for the next five years to capacitate women and bring them into decision making positions at different levels.

Regarding implementing gender responsive budgets in the sector, $80 \%$ of the respondents consider that relevant stakeholders including women associations, youth associations and federations community representatives etc. have been engaged during the planning process. As a result, each of their plans were incorporated into health sector plans. The remaining $20 \%$ believe that there is no significant achievement except the effort made by the gender affairs department.

When we come to the transport authority, $83 \%$ of the respondents have filled the questionnaires. From these, $65 \%$ of the respondents believe that they couldn't practice the knowledge that they have acquired from the GRB training due to a lack of clear guidelines and system in place, limited know-how and commitment and a lack of attention for gender at different levels. The other $35 \%$ of the respondents revealed that they have not been exposed for such training before.

In this sector about $70 \%$ of the respondents believe that activities such as capacity building, the empowerment of women, employment creation, creating a favorable environment, and also allocation of a certain proportion of the budget for gender related activities have been done to address the gender issue. The remaining respondents believe that there is no special support for women except supporting them to improve their skill.

With regards to empowering women especially in terms of bringing them into decision making positions, $70 \%$ of the respondents believe that there is an effort to bring competent women into decision making positions and there is a system in place to empower them. In addition to this, awareness creation training has been conducted and currently due to this special provision the number of female staff has become relatively balanced. The other $30 \%$ believe that there is no such an achievement.

Concerning the achievement in mainstreaming gender into the budget and planning process, $65 \%$ of the respondents believe that activities like a quarterly evaluation of the gender affairs department, assigning adequate human resources, and the allocation of a separate budget for the department are considered as good achievements. While the remaining $35 \%$ believe that there is no separate budget allocated for gender. Therefore, from their response we can see that there is a gap in the understanding of a gender responsive budget.

From the bureau of justice, the response rate was $50 \%$. The respondents claimed that working in a team was one of the hampering factors for the GRB practice. In addition to this they have raised attitudinal problems and a lack of a conducive work structure (due to lack of awareness) as major challenges in the implementation of GRB.

In terms of mainstreaming gender issues into next year's annual plan, most of the respondents consider that gender issues are taken into account while allocating budget for pro-poor sector and both women's and men's needs are identified according to the gender responsive budget manual.

Concerning the identification of gender issues in the sector activities, more than $50 \%$ of the respondents stated that they do not have adequate information. In terms of female empowerment especially bringing them into decision making positions, $80 \%$ of the respondents consider different activities have been performed including providing leadership training, conducting experience sharing and other related activities.

Previously women used to face a lack of ownership of assets (as collateral) to borrow from the credit service. However, the de facto has shown that the female repayment rate of the loan is far better than their male counterparts. On account of this, women began to improve themselves as well as their family. Generally, $83 \%$ of the questionnaires were collected back from the agency.

With regard to the limited practice of GRB, $85 \%$ of the respondents claimed the reason to be due to a lack of GRB training while the remaining $15 \%$ believe that even the training by its self was not adequate to practice GRB.

On the other hand 90\% of the respondents claim that gender issues were identified before preparing the annual plan of their respective sector. In this regard, the sector has made an assessment on how women had benefited from the saving and credit service and which new targets have been set. In addition to this, different arrangements were made to provide loans through peer group formation without requiring asset collateral and lower interest rate for poor women.

Regarding the improvement of women's leadership role, $20 \%$ of the respondents believe that there is not any effort that has been made while $15 \%$ responded that they have no information. The remaining 65\% consider trainings and workshops had been conducted on the issue.

From the water and energy bureau there was a $66 \%$ response rate. Though different activities have been made to reduce the work burden of the women, there is still a wide gap in implementing gender responsive budget in the sector. From the respondents, $75 \%$ of them said that they haven't participated in GRB training while the remaining $25 \%$ also believe that the training was not sufficient to apply it adequately.

Most of the respondents believed that gender issues had been identified before implementing different programs so that activities like the participation of women during water construction projects, provision of clean water, energy saving stoves, renewable energy (solar energy), facilitating ways to work in an organized way in the mining sector and other related actions are in place.

Pertaining to empowering and bringing women into decision making positions, $42 \%$ of the respondents state that water committees usually include women as committee members and when we come to rural areas more than $50 \%$ of the committees members are women. The other $20 \%$ believe that different activities have been conducted in this aspect while the remaining $38 \%$ believe adequate activities have not been performed to empower the women in the sector.

In terms of implementing gender responsive budgeting in the sector, $85 \%$ of the respondents believe that the program budget is not yet practiced in the sector so they are unable to implement GRB. The remaining $15 \%$ responded that they did not know anything about it.

From Oromia road authority only $50 \%$ of the questionnaires were filled and collected back. The respondents list some of the challenges that hinder them to apply the knowledge acquired from the gender responsive budget training. The main challenges that most of the respondents raised includes attitudinal problem, lack of skills, absence of an encouraging environment and insufficient knowledge about the issue.

Regarding empowerment of women and bringing them into decision making positions, 49\% of the respondents consider that the organization has been providing educational opportunities from the diploma to master's level for women while $51 \%$ believe that there is no significant effort to bring the women into leadership positions.

Concerning the mainstreaming of gender issues in the annual plan and budget, most of the respondents agree that the 2015/16 plan is gender responsive. In this aspect, pro-poor sectors got the priority and gender issues are considered appropriately. In addition to this, the priorities of men and women have been analyzed before allocating the budget. For that matter, a manual was prepared that supports its implementation. Every department integrated gender issues in their plan and budget while the gender affairs department also has been allocated to accomplish its plan. Vis-à-vis identifying gender issues, women are prohibited to engage in work that harms their health and appropriate job opportunities have been created for them.

About $35 \%$ of the respondents believe that besides providing skill trainings, different activities have been performed to bring competent women into decision making positions though it is not to a satisfactory level. Here, both short and long-term training were provided for the women and as a result empowered women have been appointed in different decision-making positions. The other $65 \%$ believe that nothing has been done to empower women so as to bring them into the decision-making position.

Concerning gender responsive budget implementation, about half of the respondents think that there is no separate budget allocated for women but a specific budget is allocated for the gender affairs department like the other departments. They also added that since the mandate of the sector is by its nature gender sensitive women benefit from their interventions. The remaining respondents replied that they had not heard about GRB before. From these respondents, we can see that they don't know about what GRB is and how it is applied.

When we came to the bureau of labor and social affairs, only half of the questionnaires are collected back. The experts have no idea about gender responsive budget and so not enough information is collected from the sector. Regardless the information that has been collected is analyzed as follows.

Regarding the application of the knowledge from GRB training, $80 \%$ of the respondent's state that they haven't got training on GRB and the remaining believe that the role of higher officials is crucial and so they haven't engaged in this kind of activities. Concerning the identification of gender issues, most of the respondents believe that the planning processes as well as performance have been gender sensitive. In addition to this, budget for the gender affairs department has been allocated for capacity building activities. Above all, the respondents believe that the 2015/16 plan integrates gender especially in program descriptions, in targets, in indicators and in activities.

Concerning women empowerment and bringing them into decision making positions, $80 \%$ of the respondents believe women are encouraged to participate actively in a 1:5 formation, allocating a budget for women's educational opportunities and women have been given facilitation roles in different activities to enhance their leadership skill. The remaining 20\% of the respondents replied that they do not have any information about it.

About $55 \%$ of the respondents listed the best practices in gender responsive budgeting in the sector. These include involving women to participate from the planning stage to implementation, making gender as a priority area for the sector and having the best plan and performance with regard to addressing gender issues which had been championed by women and children affairs bureau.

The role of Oromia's bureau of finance and economic development to implement gender responsive budget is very crucial. However only $66 \%$ of the questionnaires were collected back and from this only $30 \%$ of the respondents filled the questionnaires.

The respondents from different departments replied that the program's budget had not yet started and that there is no significant action taken to bring competent women into decision making positions. Regarding the planning and budget preparation process, most of the jobs are done with different sectors and controlling them has been made to integrate gender aspects. Although most of the trainings were conducted to build the capacity of experts who are working in different sectors, trainings should be focused on relevant bodies which can affect its implementation.

From this, we can understand that though it has a key role in institutionalizing gender responsive budgets in the region the sector has a lot of gaps in the implementation process.

One of the objectives of Ethiopia construction industry policy is ensuring female participation and them benefiting from construction industry development. From the construction industry policy objective, we can easily dig out some gender aspects including:

1. The construction policy industry encourage both government and industrial stakeholders to improve the technical skills of women, their participation and they create job opportunities which in turn helps them to create their own wealth;
2. The construction industry forum will be established based on the voluntary participation of women;
3. Encouraging equitable benefits to women based on their contribution through job allocating.

The challenges that experts encounter while they are trying to convert the acquired knowledge from the training into practice include attitudinal problems and inconvenient systems in place. Though the above are challenges, most of the respondents believe that gender issues are identified and gender analysis has been done before allocating a budget and as a result the benefits to women have been ensured.

About half of the respondents believe that women's specific needs are identified and then acknowledged to address them during the implementation process. The remaining $50 \%$ of respondents say that they don't know anything about the issue.

The other area of focus is the way gender issues are integrated into the program budget of the sector. In this regard, half of the respondents believe that gender issues are integrated in the sector's program description, indicators, targets and activities while 50\% believe that it is just integrated in activities.

Regarding the empowerment of women and bringing women into decision making positions, half of the respondents consider that there are some efforts taken while the remaining respondents believe that there are not many/significant measures being taken to bring them into these positions.

In relation to best practice while implementing gender responsive budgeting in their sector, half of the respondents believes that there are no special practices in implementing GRB while the remaining respondents believe integrating gender issues into the annual budget of the sector as a good practice.


## Good Practices while implementing GRB among different sectors

During implementing gender responsive budgeting among other sectors, good practices raised by most of the respondents include the identification of gender issues before budget allocation, awareness creation and TOT to bring attitudinal change which as a result led to improved development and productivity of women.

Most of the respondents agreed that the planning and budget process of the health sector can be considered as good practice where there is society participation from the very beginning. Other good practices include translation of the GRB guideline to the local language by the bureau of finance and economic development, synergy among health sectors in place, devising a women's development army, establishment of a system for women income generating activities, developing feasible policies and strategies, letting the gender affairs department head be a member of the management team and having review meetings in the health sector

## The Concerns that Future GRB Trainings Should Take into Account

In this assessment the respondents are asked for the way forwards in future areas of concern related to GRB training in order to institutionalize gender across sectors. Thus, the following are some of the recommendations:
> Conducting gender responsive budgeting training for different stockholders from the regional to the woreda level until clear attitudinal changes have effectuated. The training should be continuous and relevant bodies should participate; as bringing attitudinal change may take some time, the training should be given frequently.
> Preparing practical guidelines on how to practice gender responsive budgeting and creating awareness for the relevant bodies starting from the region to the lower levels. In addition to this, they should facilitate an experience sharing program for different implementers.
> Besides capacity building training, establishing a structure for gender affairs in each sector will helps to follow-up the implementation process.

## Ranking the Status of GRB implementation in different Sectors

In addition to assessing the overall situation of GRB implementation, the assessment has a portion that asks respondents to rank the level of institutionalization of gender responsive budgeting in different categories (low, medium or high) as indicated by the following figure.


## Major Challenges while Implementing GRB in the Region

- Lack of ownership, looking the issue as just a women's problem, low experience and low educational level of women, work burden for women and the program budget being not yet implemented in the region.
- Limited availability of sex disaggregated and gender analytical data, high employee turnover and neglected use of the GRB guideline.
- Low effort to upgrade their status among women and limited budget and human resources for the gender affairs department.
- Absence of a gender affairs structure at the lower level of government such as at woreda level.


## Conclusion and Recommendation

As the assessment report revealed, the monitoring and evaluation process has been carried out through reports, field visits, preparing a checklist, every week command post follow-up through plasma. Though training on GRB has been conducted at different times, the awareness level of experts is still very low. This is because of high staff turn-over, providing training opportunities for the same person many times, limited access of training and a program budget not yet implemented in the region. Based on the findings the following recommendations have been drawn:
> Providing continuous training until attitudinal problem resolved


## Benshangul Gumuz Regional State <br> Overview of the region

Benishangul Gumuz is a regional state of Ethiopia located in the western corridor of the country bordering the Amhara and Oromia regional states. The region is structured into 3 zones and 21 woredas. The 2007 national census reported that the region had a population of 784,345 with a balanced sex ratio of 398,655 male and 385,690 female, residing in 173,718 households (CSA, 2007). Although there are 10 urban centers in the region, the majority of the population (86.49\%) still lives in the rural part of the region. Other than the native people of the region there are also a substantial number of refugees due to its border with Sudan.

The limited development of infrastructures, including health centers, education, road construction as well as information technology, had raised the risk margin for its residents. From this it is quite clear that the vulnerability is much higher for women. Other than the poor infrastructure, unemployment, limited access to agricultural technologies, limited opportunity to creating jobs and so on are also stressing factors for the people of the region.

This can be witnessed in the following chart of which the majority of the respondents were men.

With regard to the respondents age, $50 \%$ of them are in the age group 21-30, 30\% of them are 31-40, and $12.5 \%$ of the respondents are 41-50 while the rest are over 50.

In terms of educational background, $73.1 \%$ of the male respondents hold first degrees and $26.9 \%$ of them have master degrees while $91.7 \%$ of the female respondents are first degree holders and 8.3 \% of them have masters degrees.

As can be seen in the graph below, the majority of the respondents are from the budget and planning department of their sector.

## Respondants department


\& Planning \& Budget ${ }^{*}$ Gender affairs

Figure: Respondents Profile by job department

Respondents were also asked to answer if they have ever taken training on gender, of which $52.5 \%$ of the respondents said yes and $47.5 \%$ said no. Among those who had taken the GRB training, 20\% confirmed that they received skill and knowledge while $12.5 \%$ did not receive any skill and knowledge while the majority of them (67.5\%) were non-responsive.

Q. 1 have you ever attended training on gender?
Q. 2 have you ever attended training on gender responsive budgeting?
Q. 3 did you apply the knowledge and skill at your work?

Those who have replied that they couldn't apply what they have learned from the GRB training into their practice had raised three main reasons:

1. Limited budget allocated for the gender affairs department and a lack of coordination among departments,
2. The attitudinal gap witnessed among the management and their lack of commitment,
3. Attitudinal bias and the gradual change on the progress of the attitude


## Q. 1 Respondents ranking their awareness on gender

Q. 2 Respondents ranking their respective sector on gender responsiveness

As the above graph illustrates, $60 \%$ of respondents grade their knowledge on gender issues as at a medium level while $20 \%$ ranked it as high, $12.5 \%$ as low and the rest, $2.5 \%$ and $5 \%$ were very high and nonresponsive respectively. Similarly in terms of the grading of sectors on their active involvement in gender affairs (gender mainstreaming), $52.2 \%$ ranked their sectors as being at a medium level, $20 \%$ ranked their sectors as low, $12.5 \%$ as very low and the rest of the respondents ( $7.5 \%$ ) either see their respective sectors' involvement as high or they are non-responsive.


## Challenges to practice GRB

For the activity of their sector in the practice of gender mainstreaming, $30 \%$ of respondents stated that they had an unconducive working structure while $12 \%$ stated that there was a lack of skill and knowledge, $15 \%$ responded that there was attitudinal bias and an unconducive working structure, $10 \%$ responded that there was an attitudinal bias and limited skill while $3 \%$ of the respondents considered all the listed factors to be the reason for low gender mainstreaming activity and the rest, $18 \%$, did not respond.

In response to the gender mainstreaming activity of departments in each sectors' performance report, $83 \%$ of the respondents confirmed that their sector's performance included gender issues while $17 \%$ responded that it did not include such issues.
" yes


Was your sector's performance report gender inclusive?
Moreover, when asked if the sector's departmental plan was gender considerate, $62.5 \%$ of the respondents assured that it incorporated gender issues while $25 \%$ of them replied that it did not include gender issues and the rest, $12.5 \%$, were non-responsive. Respondents were also asked if the sectors identified sector specific gender issues, of which $62.5 \%$ of them replied with affirmation while $17.5 \%$ of them acknowledged that the sector did not identify gender issues and $20 \%$ of the respondents were nonresponsive. On the other hand, $60 \%$ of the respondents verified that their respective sectors' 2015/16 plan had mainstreamed gender while $22.5 \%$ replied that it did not and $17.5 \%$ did not give any information.

Q. 9 is gender mainstreaming present in your sectors' departments?
Q. 10 are gender issues identified in your sector?
Q. 11 was gender mainstreamed in your sector's previous year plan?

The above graph shows the manner in which the 2015/16 plan and budget mainstreamed gender. Although the majority (52.5\%) turned out to be non-responsive to this question, $20 \%$ of respondents revealed that gender is mainstreamed in the pro-poor programs and projects. $17.5 \%$ mainstreamed
gender by identifying the needs of men and women by conducting gender analysis and the rest, 5\%, incorporated gender by allocating a budget to women specific programs and projects.

With regards to the inclusion of activities that deal with empowering female employees in each sector's strategic plans, $35 \%$ of the respondents assured that the plan included activities of empowering women such as organizing vocational training, while $37 \%$ claimed that their sector's plan does not have such kinds of activities and the rest $28 \%$ do not have information about this matter.

In terms of efforts to empower women employees, especially to hold decision making positions at sectoral levels, respondents have listed the following activities in their respective sector:

- Women empowerment activities in sectoral plans,
- Giving women opportunities in training, promotion and employment (affirmative action),
- Providing female teachers with leadership training to be effective in school management positions,
- Creating women forums and platforms to create a network in sharing experiences and advancement of their capacity,
- Giving priority to promote women into decision making positions,
- Advocating and encouraging female workers to be competent in managerial positions.
- Sectoral planning to address attitudinal bias and promoting women workers to decision making positions,
- Increasing female participation in leadership trainings.

Q. 16 Were gender indicators included in the sector's monitoring and evaluation and action plan checklists?
Q. 17 Factors of the gender neutral monitoring and evaluation checklists

On monitoring and evaluation activities, the above graph shows that the majority of the respondents (62.5\%) stated that the sectoral monitoring and evaluation checklists and action plans have included gender indicators, while $30 \%$ admitted that it did not and the rest ( $7.5 \%$ ) were non-responsive. Furthermore, those $30 \%$ who admitted that the monitoring and evaluation process did not include gender indicators had identified the causes; 10\% attributed this to limited skill, 10\% to attitudinal bias and 10\% to an unconducive working structure while $2.5 \%$ of the respondents' assume all of the above factors apply. However $67.5 \%$ of the respondents failed to respond to identify the cause for their sector due to the gender neutral monitoring and evaluation process.

The respondents were also asked to grade their respective sector's awareness on GRB, of which $42.5 \%$ of the respondents graded it as low, $55 \%$ medium and $2.5 \%$ were non-responsive. The second graded question related to the gender responsiveness of sectoral plans; $40 \%$ of the respondents graded the responsiveness as low, $42.5 \%$ medium and $12.5 \%$ fond it to be highly responsive while $5 \%$ gave no response. Similarly in grading institutional support for a gender department /gender focal person, 45\% ranked the support as low, $42.5 \%$ medium, $7.5 \%$ high while $5 \%$ were non responsive.

The other grading point was the commitment of sector heads (management) to gender affairs endeavors, of which $42.5 \%$ of the respondents graded the commitment as low, $52.5 \%$ graded it as medium and the rest (5\%) were non responsive.

In grading their respective sector's budget for women specific programs, 67.5\% graded the budget as low, 22.5\% graded the budget as medium, while $2.5 \%$ saw it as high and $7.5 \%$ were non-responsive. In terms of rating the fairness of their sector's budget in its benefits to both men and women, most respondents (40\%) ranked the fairness as medium while $32.5 \%$ ranked it as low and $22.5 \%$ ranked it as high and the rest (5\%) were non-responsive. Moreover, in rating their sector's budget in its role of improving the opportunities to women and their participation as well as advocating for women's rights, $47.5 \%$ of the respondents rated this as being at a low level, $47.5 \%$ rated this as medium while $2.5 \%$ rated this as being at a high level and the rest, $2.5 \%$, were non-responsive.

Respondents had also identified the following best practice and fertile grounds from their sector's GRB effort

- Plan based intervention on gender issues along with allocating a budget for trainings,
- Allocating a budget for gender mainstreaming endeavors,
- Separate toilets constructed for each sex in schools,
- Gender experts taking part in project and program evaluation,
- Collaborative efforts between the gender department, planning and budgeting and the population department,
- The region's women's affairs bureau evaluating each sector's performance report
- Sectors like agriculture designing its services specific to women
- Planning activities to raise the benefit to women of the credit service.

Finally the respondents were asked if they could provide comments on GRB training so as to develop a much better and effective training module and training presentation. The following are some of the responses:

- It would be more effective if higher officials and sector heads took the training
- Planning and budgeting experts should be trained on GRB for improving its effectiveness
- Organizing regular training on budget preparation
- Women forums should be supported and strengthened by gender experts and technical assistance.
- Effectiveness of gender trainings should be regularly assessed
- The training should also be provided by those who have experience and adequate knowledge on the subject matter


## Ethiopian Somali Region State

## Existing Situation of the Region

The Ethiopian Somali Region is one of the regions that was selected for the 2015/16 assessment study to confirm the implementation of Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) successive trainings delivered for federal and regional departments by the Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation. Gig Giga town is located in eastern Ethiopia. Previously the town was located in the then Harerge Administrative Region but, now it is the regional capital city of the Ethiopia Somali Region.

The Ethiopian Somali Region is one of the nine regions, and according to the 2014/2015 Central Statistical information the total population of the region is $5,598,002$. From the total population, the urban population is 439,003 male and 374,000 female in total 813,003 while the rural population is $2,583,997$ male and 2,201,002 female in total 4,784,999. The number of children below 15 years reaches 2,155,224 and the number of women aged $15-49$ is also 1,306,906.

The livelihood of the majority of the regional population is agriculture, which is mainly animal resource. Industry and services also support the regional economy.

There are many health facilities in the region which include 10 hospitals, 206 health centers and 973 health posts. The 2014/2015 report of Bureau of Water shows that the regional water coverage reaches $40.32 \%$.

## The Existing Situation of women in the Region.

According to the 2014 population and health assessment report, the participation of primary education was 40.4 \% for women and 49.2 \% for men in the region. Although the participation of women shows an encouraging change, when the level of education increases to secondary education, the participation decreases dramatically and reaches only $6.4 \%$. This shows extensive work is required by identifying the reason why women break their education.

In the health sector, of the regional women 15.2\% gave birth in governmental health intuitions while 0.7\% in private health institutions. In the region, $83.2 \%$ of women give birth at home. The reasons that they raised include: 11.2 \% indicated that they requested a higher amount of money in the health institutions, 9.2\% mentioned that there is not an adequate medical supply in the health institutions, $50.1 \%$ indicated that the location of the institutions is far away from their residence and there is no transport service to reach there.

In order to make 70\% of the loan services of micro financing accessible to female headed house hold and the loan supply is planned to raise that to $87 \%$ in this fiscal year benefited from the loan and saving.

## 1. The result of the Assessment Study

### 1.1 Total information on Respondents

For the assessment study of Ethio- Somali National Regional State which is conducted in Gig Giga town, general information on the participants is presented in the following table. The participants are employees of the Regional Bureau of Agriculture, Bureau of Health, Bureau of Education, Water and Sewerage Authority, Bureau of labor and Social Security, Transport Authority, Roads Authority, Bureau of Works and Urban Development, Micro and Small, Bureau of justice, Micro Finance, and Bureau of Finance and Economic Development.


As shown above, the number of women is very few in the institutions where the assessment study was conducted. This implies that it needs to work hard in teaching and training women. On the other hand, among the Somali regional institutions only 11\% have an established gender office. This shows that there is no responsible body that follows up and implements gender perspectives.

## Participants on Gender Perspective Training



Trainings on awareness creation have been given to the respective actors at different times in order to avoid inequality of gender in the society. However, from the participants of this assessment study, 67.9\% expressed that the training on gender perspectives has helped them to examine their previous negative attitude, while $32.1 \%$ have indicated that they did not take any training on gender perspectives.

From the participants of the study the majority of professionals have placed their awareness on gender at a medium level, while half of the respondents have ranked it at high and very high levels. In relation to this, the number of respondents who took training on gender responsive budgeting is less than half as shown in the below graph.

## have you interlalize the Knowledge you acquired from the training?

III Yes No no response


Since 2012/2013, the Gender Directorate of the Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation has organized trainings on GRB and delivered it to different regional professionals who work on gender, planning and budgeting. Out of the different sector institutions of Gig Giga in which this assessment was conducted, $39 \%$ of professionals who work in gender, planning and budgeting have been trained in GRB awareness creation training. Out of the trainees, $48 \%$ expressed that the training has changed their negative attitude towards gender as well as helping them to understand GRB concepts and to fill their capacity gap. They will make effort to implement it into their work. $18 \%$ of professionals replied that the capacity building trainings around GRB are short and not sustainable, while the remaining $39 \%$ gave no response. $61 \%$ of the participants expressed that they did not participate in any of the capacity building training around GRB.

The capacity building training is delivered based on practical exercises which help to give adequate knowledge and the capacity to convert the knowledge into practice. However, they couldn't cascade and implement it in their work. The reasons that they mentioned include, the number of planning, budgeting and gender professionals in GRB capacity building training was limited, there was a lack of a strong gender office in the majority of institutions and a lack of strong and sustainable gender related training.

## Activities of Regional Institutions on Gender Perspectives.



Even though, there is no strong and organized gender section in the majority of the regional institutions, out of the participants of the study $7.1 \%$ expressed that there is higher level gender related activities in their institutions, $32.1 \%$ indicated that the gender related activity of their institution is at high level, $32.1 \%$ gave it a medium level, while the remaining $21.4 \%$ indicated that it was at a low level and $7.1 \%$ said it was at the lowest level. Those who gave high and medium levels did not identify the activities in their institutions but, those who mention low and lowest levels have raised reasons such as attitudinal problems of the professionals, limitations of skill, lack of a proper working system and lack of guidelines or practical manuals in their institutions.

## Main Reasons for Gender Related Activities being at a Lower level.



As shown above, the rank given for the activities of gender perspectives by regional institutions include, $28.5 \%$ ranking these activities at low levels and they mentioned reasons such as limitation of skill, capacity building trainings on gender perspectives being not successive and lasting for a short period of time. In addition $29 \%$ indicated that there was a shortage of trained professionals in the sector, $21 \%$ also mentioned that there was a lack of an organized office responsible for gender activities and there was a lack of proper monitoring and evaluation for the existing sections. $4 \%$ replied that there were attitudinal problems in gender related activities. Moreover, adverse attitude on gender in society has been reflected on the professionals of the institutions. Thus, the professionals think that gender means women and the problem of women. $7 \%$ of participants of the study indicated different reasons other than the above mentioned such as a lack of a transparent guideline, a lack of a practical manual as well as a lack of commitment while $39 \%$ gave no response.

Efforts made to implement GRB in the Region


Question 8 Is gender issues mainstreamed in the performance report of working sections of the institution?

Question 9 Is there a system to consider gender issues in the work plan of the working sections?
Question 10 Are gender issues identified in the institution?
Question 11 Does the sector plan of 2015/2016 mainstream gender issue adequately?
Question 12 Does the strategic plan of the institution contain different professional trainings to empower women?

It is known that gender equality is one of the government's priorities to sustain the developmental activities of the country. Accordingly, GRB is one of the instruments to ensure gender equality. In recognition of this, the Gender Directorate of the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development has organized capacity building trainings on GRB and has trained gender, planning and budgeting
professionals of different regions since 2012/2013. Following this, the participants of the study expressed that the training has contributed to change their attitude and fill in the capacity gap of the planning and budgeting professionals of the regional sector bureau. In relation to this, it is indicated in the study that there are activities to institutionalize GRB. Out of the selected institutions of this study, around 67.9\% indicated that they work by incorporating gender perspectives in the performance report of their working section.

In the Bureau of Education, apart from its professional training activities, the effort in supporting women in the institution especially empowering them and bringing them into the leadership position is limited. The reasons that they indicate include a lack of inspiration and a lack of proper educational background. In the $2^{\text {nd }}$ GTP it is planned that $25 \%$ of the school's leadership positions will be women.

The Bureau of Education is one of the institutions which have identified the needs of women and the need to encourage them. Based on this, its activities related to gender include, enabling female teachers to school leadership, activities in relation to sex harassment of female students, awareness training for the leadership at all levels and filling the technology gap of women. Despite the fact that the program budget is not implemented in regions, gender gaps are filled using studies. For example, a study on the participation of female secondary school students can be taken as experience.

With regards to the Bureau of Health, apart from its professional services to the society, has activities in relation to empowering women and bringing them to leadership positions which include, equal services for women and men and giving priority to assign female graduates to urban centers. The Bureau of Agriculture, the Bureau of Labor and Social Security, and the Bureau of Justice have a plan to empower women in their institutions and bring them to middle level leadership positions apart from the professional trainings.

In relation to microfinance, despite it having no gender office, it has a vision to make women self-reliant in the economy. In its plan, $50 \%$ of beneficiaries in the sector will be women and the majority of jobs created in the sector or community will be given to women. For example, in the action plans such as loan and saving support, professional training, etc. the beneficiary of women is significant.

## Future Direction of Trainings of Gender Responsive Budgeting

For the question posed to the respondents, "How do you think about the continuation of the capacity building training to implement gender responsive budgeting at full capacity in the future?" the points
mentioned by the respondents include, preparing adequate training for stakeholders from region up to woreda level until attitudinal change on gender budgeting is achieved, organizing training of trainers, establishing a support and monitoring system for regional activities, experience sharing with other regions and organizing training for the leadership in order to make them committed.

Quantitative Perspective of Institutionalizing GRB in Ethiopian Somali region bureaus


Question 1 At what level do you put the awareness level of the institution with respect to gender responsive budgeting?

Question 2 What is the extent that the plan and budget preparation of sectors is gender responsive?

Question 3 what is the support level of other working sections to gender office of your institution?

Question 4 What is the commitment level of the leadership at all levels in your organization in mainstreaming gender?

Question 5 From the duties and responsibilities point of view of your office, How do you express the budget allocation for programs/projects that benefit women?

Question 6 What is the extent that equitable benefit of men and women from the allocated budget for the office, the activities performed, the services delivered by the institution?

Question 7 What is the capacity of the budget allocation in ensuring the right of women and developing their role?

Apart from the descriptive questionnaire of the assessment study on gender responsive budgeting, the participants were requested to show the existing situation of their sector to institutionalize gender. Accordingly, they rank low, medium and high levels and the results of the quantitative information are depicted in the above graph.

## The Way Forward and Future Directions

Based on the findings of the assessment study, the following future directions have been indicated to institutionalize gender responsive budgeting in all sector offices, making the ongoing activities sustainable, avoiding the existing problems and to bring change in the future.
> Establishing independent office that follows up gender perspective in the majority of regional institutions including Bureau of Finance and Economy. In addition organizing practical training to disseminate gender responsive budgeting for employees.
> Assigning an inspection body that evaluates and controls the sectors and introducing monitoring and evaluation system.
> Preparing working manual for gender perspective in the institutions.
> Preparing awareness creation workshop by the regional Bureau of Women, Children, and Youth to eliminate negative attitude on gender and to empower women.
> Organize conferences, workshops etc. on gender for the leadership and professionals at all levels to uphold their awareness on gender and work in collaboration with relevant actors as well as institutions to fill gender gap and ensure gender equality.

## PART FOUR

## MAJOR CHALLENGES IDENTIFIED IN THE ASSESSMENT

> The loose structure of GRB practice failed to create an accountable system,
> Lack of sex disaggregated data,
> Lack of gender mainstreaming guidelines in some sectors,
> The attitudinal bias that considers gender as an additional time consuming task and a complication to their work,
> The decision makers limited knowledge on gender,
> The attitudinal bias that makes experts consider gender as a problem of women. They also consider GRB to be a budget for women only and the gender affairs departments to be the only responsible body,
> Due to the inadequate time of GRB trainings and the inconsistency of the trainings many of the experts did not grasp adequate skill son GRB,
> A lack of a conducive working structure and a poor budgeting system creates budget constraints on the gender affairs department. Furthermore, the limited attention to the department is also raised as another hindering factor,
> A lack of a gender affairs department in a few sectors.

## PROPOSED RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the findings of this assessment, the following actions are proposed to reinforce the ongoing GRB efforts for sustainable and equitable development.
> To design and provide practice oriented training that is developed by the coordinated efforts of the bureaus of Finance and Economic cooperation and the Women and Children Affairs bureau,
> Sector bureaus should broaden the accessibility of the gender training and the GRB training to their entire staff,
> Technical support should also be available to GRB practicing sectors (possible role of MoFEC \& BOFED),
$>$ A gender focal person should gain due attention and their significant role should be recognized,
> The monitoring and evaluation process should be strong and conducted on a regular basis along with the feedback; significant attention should also be given to the documentation task as well as the development of sex disaggregated data,
> Workshops and seminars should be organized so that sectors could exchange their best practices and build up a think tank group,
> There should also be awareness creation trainings and workshops that tackle the gender bias,
> Work in collaboration with responsible bodies to confront the attitudinal basis of decision makers at all levels,

## CONCLUSION

The Government of Ethiopia had been making various efforts to address gender inequality. One of such efforts is the development of a women policy that is made to have a cross cutting agenda incorporating every sector. Consequently the ministry of finance and economic cooperation has been involved in mainstreaming gender as part of its core mandate by developing a gender responsive budgeting guideline, by introducing GRB concepts to federal as well as regional sectors, and the training of planning and budgeting experts as well as decision makers. In this regard this assessment is meant to evaluate the results of these GRB trainings and the challenges that have been encountered during its practice.

The assessment showed that there are some promising results in the GRB practice as well as its institutionalization. Some of them, for example, are making gender inclusive and making gender mainstreaming one of the evaluating points for the sector's plans; also, identifying the needs of women and making arrangements to address these needs.

On the other hand, some challenges were identified in the practice such as: thinking that the GRB budget was for women only, attitudinal bias, limited skill, limited commitment to translate the training knowledge into practice, lack of baseline data on men and women beneficiaries, lack of gender inclusivity in some sectors in their monitoring and evaluation activities, making gender mainstreaming as an add-on exercise etc.. A remedial proposition had been made to address these challenges.

In conclusion, to see the institutionalization of GRB, this assessment had taken a sample of institutions and identified the strong and weak points of the practice. All in all it is quite clear that, even though there are some promising works and results in various sectors, there is still a long way to go in achieving GRB institutionalization that only could be realized with a committed and coordinated effort.

## ANNEX

## The Ministry of Finance and Economy Cooperation

## Gender Affairs Directorate

This questionnaire is prepared by the Ministry of Economic Cooperation, Gender Affairs Directorate. The main purpose of this questionnaire is to see and assess the sectors office gender responsive budgeting activities perspective (Federal) Ministry of Economic Cooperation. When in implementation process, knowledge level, strength and weakness and coordination procedures is the main aim of this questioner. So we thank you for your consult to fill the questionnaire.
I. Sex Male $\square$ Female
II. Age 1-30 $\square \quad$ 31-40 $\square \quad$ 41-50 $\square \quad$ Above 50

III Educational Background $\quad$ Diploma $\square \quad$ Degree $\square \quad$ Masters $\square \quad$ PhD $\square$
IV. Organization /sector
V. Work positions (Department) $\qquad$

1. Have you participated on gender responsive budgeting capacity building training?
2. Yes
3. I do not know
4. For Question 1 if you answer is "Yes", have you acquired adequate knowledge on Gender Responsive Budget?
5. Yes
6. No
7. If your answer is "Yes" for the above question, did you utilize the knowledge/skill to yourself?
8. Yes
9. No
10. For Question, 3 if your answer is "No" please explain the reason for not incorporating it in your work.
11. What challenges was encountered during implementing Gender Responsive Budgeting?

Attitude problem
Lack of skill (Limitation) / technical knowhow/
Difficulty of working Procedure
Other $\qquad$
6. Do your sector/Institution taken into account the gender issue in last year performance review?

1. Included
2. Not included
3. Is gender issue included in the institute departments (teams) performance reports?
4. Yes
5. Not Mentioned
6. Is gender identified in your institute/sector?
7. Identified
8. Not identified
9. I do not know
10. In the sector/institution, does the 2008 annual budget plan adequately address the gender issue?
11. $\square \mathrm{Yes}$
12. $\square$ Not Included
13. I do not know $\square$
14. In what manner did your institute (sector's) 2008 program budget /budget allocation incorporate the gender issue?
15. Allocating a separate budget for women only
16. Budget allocation supported by the budget process based on the needs of women and men gender disaggregated analysis
17. Give emphasis for gender issue in poverty alleviation program of gender allocation
18. If there is any reason please explain
19. Explain if your sector/institute identified special needs of women, please describe the steps and process you took.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
20. In which segment of the program budget do we see the gender issue clearly in 2008 annual budget year?
21. Program Profile
22. Target
23. $\square$ Indicator
24. In practice $\square$
25. In all $\square$ 6. If any
26. In the sector/institute, does your strategic plan include women empowering skill/academic training/ in the budget year?
27. Yes
28. No
29. I do not know
30. Beyond the profession training, to support women employee (especially to bring and empower women into leadership position).
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
31. Please explain your sector (institution) strength in implementing gender responsive budget in planning and budget process.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
32. Please explain your good experience in mainstreaming gender issue in your sector program budgeting process for other sectors.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
33. Do gender issue indicators are included in program, monitoring and evaluation checklist/documents?
34. "Yes" included $\square \quad$ 2. Not included
35. Please explain the reason for not included if your answer is "Not included".
36. Limitation of skill
37. Attitude problem
38. Other $\qquad$
39. In what procedure does the future capacity building training shall undertake in order to practice Gender Responsive Budgeting at optimum?
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

From the sector previous status aspects, select one of the levels from the following questioners.

| Questioners | Level |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Low | Medium | High |
| Generally, in the sector/institution how do you rate the general awareness of gender responsive budget? |  |  |  |
| Generally, how much is your sector plan and budget description responsive to gender responsive budget? |  |  |  |
| How would you rate the gender responsiveness of the budget cycle (from budget request until monitoring and evaluation)? |  |  |  |
| How would you rate the gender responsive budget in your sector 2008 budget year plan? |  |  |  |
| How would you rate the collaboration of MoFEC and your sector in implementing gender responsive budget? |  | v |  |
| How would you rate the support for your sector gender department in implementing gender responsive budget? |  |  |  |
| How would you rate the commitment of your sector's managers in implementing gender responsive budget? |  |  |  |
| Based on your sector mission and implementation/responsibility/, how would you explain the budget allocation for program/project to benefit women specifically? |  |  |  |
| From the budget which is allocated to your sector, the task done by the sector, the services that the sector gives, how would you rate the equitable benefit of men and women? |  |  |  |
| How would you rate the budget allocation with regard to securing women rights and promoting their role? |  |  |  |
| How would you rate the level of gender issue identification in your sector? |  |  |  |
| Rate the level of the mainstreaming gender issue to your sector's plan and budgeting process. |  |  |  |

## The Ministry of Finance and Economy Cooperation Gender Affairs Directorate

This questionnaire is prepared by the Ministry of Economic Cooperation, Gender Affairs Directorate. The main purpose of this questionnaire is to see and assess the sectors office gender responsive budgeting activity perspective (in regional/city administration/ by Ministry of Economic Cooperation). The main purpose of this question is to identify the awareness and skill of experts on GRB, the strength and weakness of sectors' GRB practice and coordination of sectors in the institutionalization of GRB. So we thank you for your consent to fill the questionnaire.
VI. Sex $\quad$ Male $\square \quad$ Female $\square$
VII. Age $\quad$ 21-30 $\square \quad$ 31-40 $\square \quad$ 41-50 $\square \quad$ Above $50 \square$
VIII. Educational background $\quad$ Diploma $\square \quad$ BA Degree $\square \quad$ Masters' Degree $\square \quad$ PhD $\square$
IX. Organization: $\qquad$
X. Work positions (department): $\qquad$
XI. years of experience on the current position $\qquad$
20. Have you ever participated in gender issue training?

Yes $\quad \square$ No $\quad \square$ I do not know
21. How do you evaluate your knowledge on gender issue?

Very Low $\square \quad$ Low $\square \quad$ Medium $\square \quad$ High $\square \quad$ Very High
22. Have you ever participated on gender responsive budgeting capacity building training?

1. Yes
2. No
3. If your answer is "Yes" for the above question, did you utilize the knowledge/skill to yourself?
4. Yes
5. No
6. For Question, 23 if your answer is "No", please explain the reason for not incorporating the knowledge in to practice.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
.
7. How do you evaluate the gender related activities in your sector?
8. Very low $\square$
9. Low
10. Medium
11. High
12. Very high
13. For the above question, if your answer is medium, low or very low the reason is?

## Attitude problem

$\square$ Lack of skill (Limitation) / technical knowhow/
$\square$ Difficulty of working system
$\square$ Other $\qquad$
27. Is gender issue included in the institute departments (teams) performance reports?

1. Yes
2. No
3. In the sector department office plan, is there any working system uses gender lens?
4. Yes
5. No
6. I do not know
7. In your sector is gender issue identified?
8. Identified
9. Not identified
10. I do not know
11. In 2008 budget year, is the sector/institute included gender issues adequately?
12. Yes
13. No
14. I do not know
15. For the above question, if your answer is "Yes" in what manner did your institute (sector) incorporate the gender issue in 2008 budget year budget allocation?
16. Allocating a separate budget for women only
17. Budget allocation supported by the budget process based on the needs of women and men gender disaggregated analysis $\square$
18. Give emphasis for gender issue in poverty alleviation program of gender allocation
19. If there is more reason please explain $\qquad$
20. In the sector/institute, does your strategic plan include women empowering skill/academic training/ in the budget year?
21. Yes
22. No
23. I do not know
24. Beside the professional training, does your sector/institution support women employees to bring women in leadership position?
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\square$
25. Please explain your sector/institution strength in implementing gender responsive budget in planning and budget process.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
26. Do gender issue indicators are included in program, monitoring and evaluation checklist/documents?
27. Yes $\square$ 2. Not $\square$
28. Please explain the reason for not included if your answer is "Not".
29. Limitation of skill
30. Unconducive working structure
31. Attitude problem
32. Other $\qquad$
33. In what procedure does the future capacity building training shall undertake in order to practice Gender Responsive Budgeting?
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

From the sector previous status aspects, select one of the levels from the following questioners.

| Questioners | Level |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Low | Medium | High |
| Generally, in the sector/institution how do you rate awareness of gender responsive budget? |  |  |  |
| Generally, how much is your sector plan and budget description responsive to gender responsive budget? |  |  |  |
| How would you rate the support for your sector gender department from other department office? |  |  |  |
| How would you rate the commitment of your sectors' managers in mainstreaming gender issues? |  |  |  |
| Based on your sector mission and implementation/responsibility/, how would you explain the budget allocation for program/project to benefit women specifically? |  | $v$ |  |
| From the budget which is allocated to your sector, the task done by the sector, the services that the sector provides, how would you rate the equitable benefit of men and women? |  |  |  |
| How would you rate the budget allocation with regard to securing women rights and promoting their role? |  |  |  |

## Ministry of Finance and Economy Cooperation

## Interview Questions

1. What are the conducive opportunities in order to institutionalize gender issue?
2. Is the office prepare guideline /manual/ from gender responsive budget perspective based on the administrative/regional previous status?
3. What are the problems to institutionalize gender responsive budget? What are the major recommendations to solve the problem?
4. What is the tools /methods/ to institutionalize gender responsive budget procedure?
5. Do the sectors have a monitoring and evaluating system to check the responsiveness for the gender responsive budget from plan until performance process? If there is what are the procedures?

## REFERENCES

Dixon, \& Anker. (1988). Accessing women's economic contribution to development: background paper for training in population, human resource and development planning. Geneva: ILO.

Dunn, D., Almaquist, E. M., \& Chaperz, J. S. (1993). Macro structural perspectives on gender inequality. In P. England, Theory on gender: feminism on theory (pp. 69-90). New York: Walter de Gruyter.

EG-S-MS. (1998). GENDER MAINSTREAMING: Conceptual framework, methodology. Strasbourg: Group of Specialists on Mainstreaming (EG-S-MS).

ESAP2. (2015). Social accountability. ESAP FLASH .
Geremew, B. (2007). opportunities and challenges of gender mainstreaming in selected sector bureaus. Adiss Abeba: AAU university .

Haataja, M.-L., Leinonen, E., \& Mustakallio, S. (2011). Gender mainstreaming in development programmes and projects: Guide for authorities and project actors. Jyväskylä: Kopijyvä Ltd.

KayBussey, \& AlbertBandura. (1999). Social Cognitive Theory of Gender Development and Differentiation. Psychological Review, 106(4), 676-713.

Macionis, j., \& Gerber, L. (2010). Sociology (7th ed.). Toronto: Pearson.
MoFED. (2012). National Gender Responsive Budgeting Guidelines: for mainstreaming gender in the programme budget process. Adiss Abeba: MoFED.

MoWCYA. (2011). national gender mainstreaming guideline . Addis Abeba: MoWCYA.
Sandstorm, K. L., Martin, D. D., \& Fine, G. A. (2003). Symbolic interactionism at the end of the century. In G. Ritzer, \& B. Smart, Handbook of Social theory (pp. 217-231). California: SAGE publications.

Stepnisky, J., \& Ritzer, G. (2013). Sociological theory (9th ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill.
UN WOMEN. (2014). Gender Mainstreaming in Developmental programing: Guidance Note. New York: UNWOMEN.

UNDP. (2014). Gender inequality index. New York: UNDP.

UNFPA, \& UNIFEM. (2006). Gender Responsive Budgeting and Women's Reproductive Rights: a Resource Pack. New York: UNFPA; UNIFEM.

UNIFEM. (2002). Gender Budget Initiatives. Strengthening Economic and Financial Governance Through Gender Responsive Budgeting. Brussels: UNIFEM.

Walby, S. (2003-4). Gender mainstreaming: Productive tensions in theory and practice. ESRC Gender Mainstreaming Seminars. ESRC.

Wharton, A. S. (2011). The Sociology of Gender: an introduction to theory and research (2nd ed.). California: Wiley-Blackwell.

